



APPRENTICESHIPQ

HARMONISATION & TRANSLATION GUIDE

**Relating the ApprenticeshipQ Quality Criteria
with other European and International tools**

APP -
REN -
TICE -
SHIP -
Q

Authors

Anthony Camilleri⁶, Sandra Feliciano⁶, Alicia Leonor Sauli Miklavčič⁷, Miha Zimšek⁷

Contributors

From the ApprenticeshipQ Consortium:

Maja Dragan³; Teresa Frith²; Josu Galarza⁸; Dorabela Regina Chiote Ferreira Gamboa⁴; Johannes Haas³; Hagen H. Hochrinner³; Miguel Lopes⁴; Nerea Lopez⁸; Jasmina Poličnik⁷; Ricardo Jorge da Silva Santos⁴; Alicia Leonor Sauli Miklavčič⁷; Ainhoa Ullibarriarana⁸; Vaidotas Viliūnas⁵; Naïla Wagner¹; Svenja Wiechmann¹; Miha Zimšek⁷

External:

Eva Fernandez De Labastida Amurrio, Cloud Bai-Yun, Paula Barros, Gunnar Binda, Jorge Castro, Terence Clifford-Amos, Gabriele Fietz, Adam Gajek, Helen Hoffmann, Almir Kovačević, Karin Luomi-Messerer, Modesto Mateos, Norbert Schöbel, Louise Sperl

Editors

Sandra Feliciano⁶, Alicia Leonor Sauli Miklavčič⁷, Miha Zimšek⁷

Layout

Tara Drev⁶

Copyright

(C) 2020, ApprenticeshipQ

The ApprenticeshipQ Consortium

1. Duale Hochschule Baden-Württemberg	DHBW	DE
2. Association of Colleges	AoC	UK
3. FH JOANNEUM Gesellschaft mbH	FHJ	AT
4. School of Management and Technology of Porto Polytechnic	ESTG-PP	PT
5. European Association of Institutions of Higher Education	EURASHE	BE
6. Knowledge Innovation Centre	KIC	MT
7. Association of Slovene Higher Vocational Colleges	Skupnost VŠŠ	SI
8. Mondragon University	MU	ES

This project has been funded with support from the European Commission. This publication reflects the views only of the authors, and the Commission cannot be held responsible for any use which may be made of the information contained therein.

This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-ShareAlike 4.0 International



Co-funded by the
Erasmus+ Programme
of the European Union



Table of Contents

1	Introduction	7
1.1	Project context and its goals.....	7
1.2	Aim of this Guide.....	8
2	ApprenticeshipQ & other Tools - Results.....	9
2.1	European Credit system for Vocational Education and Training (ECVET)	9
2.1.1	About ECVET	9
2.1.2	ECVET relation with the ApprenticeshipQ QC	9
2.2	European Qualifications Framework (EQF)	11
2.2.1	About EQF	11
2.2.2	EQF relation with the ApprenticeshipQ QC	11
2.3	European Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance (ESG)	12
2.3.1	About ESG	12
2.3.2	ESG relation with the ApprenticeshipQ QC	12
2.4	ISO 21001	13
2.4.1	About ISO 21001.....	13
2.4.2	ISO 21001 relation with the ApprenticeshipQ QC	13
2.5	European Quality Assurance in Vocational Education and Training (EQAVET)	14
2.5.1	About EQAVET	14
2.5.2	EQAVET relation with the ApprenticeshipQ QC	14
2.6	European Credit Transfer System (ECTS)	15
2.6.1	About ECTS	15
2.6.2	ECTS relation with the ApprenticeshipQ QC	15
2.7	Diploma Supplement.....	16
2.7.1	About Diploma Supplement.....	16
2.7.2	Diploma Supplement relation with the ApprenticeshipQ QC	16

2.8	European Framework for Quality and Effective Apprenticeships (EFQEA)	17
2.8.1	About EFQEA	17
2.8.2	EFQEA relation with the Apprenticeship QC.....	17
3	Conclusions.....	18
4	Recommendations	19
5	References.....	56
6	Annexes	58
6.1	Annex I: Analysis of the tool ECVET	58
6.2	Annex II: Analysis of the tool EQF	62
6.3	Annex III: Analysis of the tool ESG.....	63
6.4	Annex IV: Analysis of the tool ISO 21001	81
6.5	Annex V: Analysis of the tool EQAVET.....	94
6.6	Annex VI: Analysis of the tool ECTS	109
6.7	Annex VI: Analysis of the tool Diploma Supplement	112
6.8	Annex VII: Analysis of the tool EFQEA.....	114



Table of Tables

Table 1: ECVET relation with the ApprenticeshipQ Criteria	58
Table 2: EQF relation with the ApprenticeshipQ Criteria.....	62
Table 3: ESG relation with the ApprenticeshipQ Criteria.....	63
Table 4: ISO 21001 relation with the ApprenticeshipQ Criteria	81
Table 5: EQAVET relation with the ApprenticeshipQ Criteria.....	94
Table 6: ECTS relation with the ApprenticeshipQ Criteria.....	109
Table 7: Diploma Supplement relation with the ApprenticeshipQ Criteria	112
Table 8: EFQEA relation with the ApprenticeshipQ Criteria	114

Abbreviations

ApprenticeshipQ	Mainstreaming Procedures for Quality Apprenticeships in Educational Organizations and Enterprises (an Erasmus+ project)
ECTS	European Credit Transfer System
ECVET	European Credit System for Vocational Education and Training
EFQEA	European Framework for Quality and Effective Apprenticeships
ESG	European Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance
EQAVET	European Quality Assurance in Vocational Education and Training
EQF	European Quality Framework
HVET	Higher Vocational Education and Training
ISO	International Organization for Standardization
QC	Quality Criteria
SME	Small and medium enterprises
VET	Vocational Education and Training



1 Introduction

1.1 Project context and its goals

The project “Mainstreaming Procedures for Quality Apprenticeships in Educational Organisations and Enterprises” (ApprenticeshipQ) aimed to support educational institutions and placement providers to offer high-quality education to their apprentices. The lack of work experience and the skills mismatch between labour demand and supply are two of the greatest challenges for young people to transition from the world of education to the world of work (European Commission 2017; OECD 2018). A promising way to face those challenges are apprenticeships. However, their implementation is complex and the lack of European guidelines to support it seems to be preventing many of the actors in the sector – higher education institutions and companies, particularly small and medium enterprises – to launch valuable, steady and sustainable Apprenticeship Programmes (Inter-agency Group on Technical and Vocational Education and Training 2017).

To address this issue, the project ApprenticeshipQ was initiated and launched with the support of the European Commission. The mission of the project was to develop management tools that support Higher Education institutions and employers to offer and direct high-quality apprenticeships (ApprenticeshipQ Consortium, 2020); and its vision that these management tools are recognised as a model to improve the quality of the apprenticeships and are adopted widely; updated and improved in the future by the users; and serve as a basis for the development of formal international standards and guidelines (ibid.). To achieve this vision, the project implemented the following strategy:

- Promoted academic discussion to determine a Typology of Apprenticeships (currently published at Wikipedia);
- In the scope of this Typology, identified best practices of apprenticeships’ management in Europe;
- From best practices, extracted Quality Criteria (QC) for apprenticeships’ management;
- Used the QC to develop:
 - a guiding Manual for Educational Organizations;
 - a guiding Manual for Placement Providers;
 - an Online Assessment Tool to be used by Educational Organizations, Placement Providers, Conformity Assessment Bodies and Regulators;
 - a formal standardization document to be published by the Portuguese Standardization Body and the International Organization for Standardization (ISO).
- Developed a Harmonization and Translation Guide to:
 - clarify how the ApprenticeshipQ QC relate with various European and International Recognition Tools and Instruments
 - promote future integration with these tools.

These outputs of the ApprenticeshipQ project are intended to strengthen the cooperation and networking between HVET institutions and the placement providers (employers), by providing

them innovative practices to enhance or establish quality management processes that were developed and tested during the project.

1.2 Aim of this Guide

Despite the various European and International Recognition Tools used to support and evaluate quality in education and training, until recently, no proposal existed on how European Higher Vocational Institutions could adapt their internal quality systems to ensure proper supervision and control of apprenticeships (Association HVC,2017).

The ApprenticeshipQ project brought a proposal in this matter. However, to boost its adoption, the market needs to understand how the ApprenticeshipQ QC relate with the pre-existing Tools and Instruments.

The aim of this guide is, therefore, to identify the conflicts and synergies between the ApprenticeshipQ QC and

- European Credit System for Vocational Education and Training (ECVET)
- European Qualification Framework (EQF)
- European Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance (ESG)
- ISO 21001 – Management System for Educational Organizations – Requirements and Guidance for Use (ISO 21001)
- Diploma Supplement (DS)
- European Credit Transfer System (ECTS)
- European Quality Assurance in Vocational Education and Training (EQAVET)
- European Quality System for Apprenticeships (EFQEA)

in order to map the complementarity and promote future harmonization and integration.

To achieve this objective, the following activities were developed:

- 1) Construction of a table to support a point-by-point comparative analyses;
- 2) Execution of the point-by-point comparative analyses and suggestion of recommendations by different Experts in the various tools;
- 3) Analyses of the results by the Consortium partners;
- 4) Decision, by consensus, of which suggested changes to make on the products containing the ApprenticeshipQ QC;
- 5) Preparation of Policy Recommendations based on the results of the comparative analyses and suggested recommendations.

2 ApprenticeshipQ & other Tools - Results

2.1 European Credit system for Vocational Education and Training (ECVET)

2.1.1 About ECVET

The European credit system for vocational education and training (ECVET) is one of the instruments helping individuals in transfer, recognition and accumulation of their assessed learning outcomes, to achieve a qualification or to take part in lifelong learning. It uses flexible and individualised learning pathways, including transnational mobility. “ECVET allows learners to accumulate, transfer and use their learning in units as these units are achieved. This enables building a qualification at learners’ own pace from learning outcomes acquired in formal, non-formal and informal contexts, in their own country and abroad. The system is based on units of learning outcomes as part of qualifications that can be assessed and validated” (Cedefop 2020a).

2.1.2 ECVET relation with the ApprenticeshipQ QC

ECVET and ApprenticeshipQ Criteria stress the importance of a shared understanding of defined learning outcomes and highlight the importance of transparency, i.e. that all stakeholders understand and agree with what is being done. In both tools, an agreement shall document the apprenticeship, including dates, learning outcomes, tasks, work space and mentoring. Both tools record, evaluate and document the learning outcomes/goals. The learning outcomes shall be validated and recognised in both tools.

On the other hand, ECVET is a lot shorter and does not encompass as many quality criteria as the AQM manuals. The tools somehow conflict in a sense that ECVET is focussing on the learning outcomes rather than learning goals (ApprenticeshipQ). ECVET is also describing learning outcomes to highlight an orientation towards the learning products and is focussing on the transferability of learning outcomes, in particular for mobility project. Furthermore, ECVET stresses the importance of documenting the learning outcomes and competences gained. It also encourages the initiation of a network to share the experience and stresses the importance of a trusting relationship between all stakeholders. In ApprenticeshipQ, the importance of a relationship, the involvement of all stakeholders and the communication between them is part of several Quality Criteria.

There might be scope to refer to ECVET in some sections of ApprenticeshipQ; e.g. section (18) on “Certification and Recognition”, which says “Learning outcomes need to be certified to be able to be transferable and recognisable”), mentions briefly Europass but there’s no reference to ECVET as a tool to record and certify credit for transfer.

2.2 European Qualifications Framework (EQF)

2.2.1 About EQF

“The European Qualifications Framework is a common European reference framework whose purpose is to make qualifications more readable and understandable across different countries and systems” (Cedefop 2020b). Covering qualifications at all levels and in all sub-systems of education and training, the EQF provides a comprehensive overview over qualifications in the European countries. The core of the EQF is its eight reference levels defined in terms of learning outcomes, i.e. knowledge, skills and autonomy-responsibility (ibid.). Each of the 8 levels of the EQF is defined by a set of descriptors indicating the learning outcomes relevant to qualifications at that level in any qualifications system (Communication department of the European Commission 2020a). Learning outcomes express what individuals know, understand and are able to do at the end of a learning process, which makes qualifications more readable and understandable across countries and systems (Cedefop 2020b).

2.2.2 EQF relation with the ApprenticeshipQ QC

There were no conflict identified between the European Qualifications Framework and ApprenticeshipQ criteria. The indicator ApprenticeshipQ criterion 20 (POGLEDAM) and criterion 21 (POGLEDAM) may be difficult to measure, so criteria for a robust institutional and regulatory framework is suggested. Further definition of measurement indicators would be helpful as well.

We recommend to standardize profile for mentors and educational institution supervisors on pedagogical as well as professional competences and experiences. Based on those, a training for mentors as well as educational institution supervisors with supporting materials shall be provided.

2.3 European Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance (ESG)

2.3.1 About ESG

The Standards and guidelines for quality assurance in the European Higher Education Area (ESG) are the basis for quality assurance in the European Higher Education Area (ENQA et al. 2015). “The focus of the ESG is on quality assurance related to learning and teaching in higher education, including the learning environment and relevant links to research and innovation. The ESG apply to all higher education offered in the European Higher Education Area regardless of the mode of study or place of delivery. It also provides the criteria at European level against which quality assurance agencies and their activities are assessed.” (ibid., 7).

2.3.2 ESG relation with the ApprenticeshipQ QC

European Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance is primarily dedicated to quality, not on professional higher education. It has also very shallow link to the labour market. ESG is generally in line with the ApprenticeshipQ criteria. The design of the learning outcomes is covered in ESG 1.2 Design and approval of programmes. ESG 1.2 and criterion 2 (Definition of SMART Learning Objectives) of the ApprenticeshipQ are in line with the design of SMART learning objectives, although the ESG is not so explicit in the definition of the objectives. ESG 1.2 and criterion 1 of the ApprenticeshipQ are in line regarding the involvement of stakeholders in designing learning objectives, considering learning objectives and learning outcomes as similar concepts.

On the other hand, ESG does not explicitly include any comment regarding data protection, nevertheless as a general approach any information management is covered by ESG 1.7 Information management. Quality criteria 11 (Monitoring of SMEs Activities), 16 (Performing and Monitoring the Assessment), 19 (Complaints and Appeals) and 22 (Establishing the Agreement) of the ApprenticeshipQ are not included in the ESG. There is also no specific section in the ESG which applies to criterion 9 (Establishing the Agreement), although ESG 1.1 which focuses on the policy for quality assurance, establishes that the policy “supports the involvement of external stakeholders in quality assurance” and “covers any elements of an institution’s activities that are subcontracted to or carried out by other parties.” Furthermore, there is no specific mention to grading on the ESG, but it can be related to the assessment.

2.4 ISO 21001

2.4.1 About ISO 21001

ISO 21001 “Educational organizations – Management systems for educational organizations – Requirements and guidance for use”, was published by the International Organization for Standardization (ISO) on May 1, 2018 and is the first ISO management system standard specifically developed for educational organizations.

This ISO project, which took four years to be developed with the participation of over 100 countries, was created to fulfil a gap in the market, identified by ISO 9001 users in the education sector. These users, responsible for *circa* twenty thousand ISO 9001 accredited certifications worldwide (ISO, 2012, 2013b, 2014), raised concerns related to the difficulties in translating ISO 9001 requirements into the educational context, due to the specificities and complexities of the sector. The ISO Central Secretariat was sensible to these concerns and in September 2013, through Resolution #101 (ISO, 2013), merged three different ongoing standardization projects in education (IWA 2/ISO 18420 for formal education, ISO 29990 for vocational training and ISO 36001 for e-learning) into one mega project that would become ISO 21001.

ISO 21001 provides a common management tool for organizations providing educational products and services capable of meeting the needs and requirements of learners and other customers (ISO 2018a). It is a stand-alone management system standard, aligned with other ISO management system standards (ibid.). ISO 21001 specifies requirements for a management system for educational organizations. All requirements of ISO 21001 are generic. They are intended to be applicable to any organization that uses a curriculum to support the development of competence through teaching, learning or research, regardless of the type, size or method of delivery (ISO 2018b).

2.4.2 ISO 21001 relation with the ApprenticeshipQ QC

Generally, ISO 21001 and ApprenticeshipQ address the same subjects, although ApprenticeshipQ has more prescriptive requirements and specifically addressing apprenticeships. ISO 21001 users can, therefore, use ApprenticeshipQ to fine tune their practices related to apprenticeships. However, there is an exception in what regards “Data Protection”, where ISO 21001 has much more prescriptive requirements. Another difference is that, although ISO 21001 addresses the need for the organization to maintain and retain documented information to support the operations and have confidence that the processes are being carried out as planned (ISO, 2018c), leaves the responsibility to choose which, to the educational organization, while ApprenticeshipQ has more concrete and prescriptive requirements in this subject – and specifically addressing the needs of apprenticeships. In what ISO 21001 and ApprenticeshipQ conflict significantly, is in their use of terminology. This aspect could be harmonized in the future for smoother integrations.

2.5 European Quality Assurance in Vocational Education and Training (EQAVET)

2.5.1 About EQAVET

EQAVET – the European Quality Assurance in Vocational Education and Training is a community of practice that promotes European collaboration in developing and improving quality assurance in VET (EQAVET 2020a). It brings together the EU Member States, the Social Partners and the European Commission to develop and improve quality assurance in European VET systems within the context of the implementation of the European Quality Assurance Reference Framework. The community leads to higher levels of cooperation and synergy within and across EU Member States on quality assurance related issues (EQAVET 2020b).

2.5.2 EQAVET relation with the ApprenticeshipQ QC

EQAVET mostly complement ApprenticeshipQ criteria. For both tools, monitoring of all processes is an integral and fundamental part. One of the key factors in quality assurance in Vocational Education and Training (VET) assumed by EQAVET is the involvement of internal and external stakeholders. Other fundamental component of the EQAVET Framework is the PDCA cycle of quality management, based on the Deming cycle. However, without the definition of SMART objectives in the planning phase, the entire cycle fails, what makes EQAVET implementation impossible. In addition to be a legal requirement, the evaluation of all processes is also an integral part of EQAVET.

Considering that the ApprenticeshipQ criteria 20 to 30 are specific to employers, particularly SMEs, it is more difficult to find a direct relationship with the EQAVET tool. Nevertheless, assuming a more open / comprehensive perspective, it is not unreasonable to assume that the fulfilment of these criteria by the host institutions for apprentice can contribute to the fulfilment of EQAVET criteria C1P1, C2I1 and C5T1. In the EQAVET process, there is no point where data protection and complaints and appeals are addressed, they are implicit in the entire (quality) process.

2.6 European Credit Transfer System (ECTS)

2.6.1 About ECTS

European Credit Transfer and Accumulation System (ECTS) is designed to make it easier for students to move between countries and to have their academic qualifications and study periods abroad recognised (Communication department of the European Commission 2020b). It is a tool of the European Higher Education Area for making studies and courses more transparent, and help students to move between countries and to have their academic qualifications and study periods abroad recognised (ibid). Credits for lectures from different institutions can be accumulated (or added up) towards one degree or qualification, allowing for much more flexibility. ECTS points/credits indicate the required workload to complete a study programme, or a module within a study programme (Atack 2020) and thus support the planning, delivery and evaluation of higher education programmes (Communication department of the European Commission 2020b).

2.6.2 ECTS relation with the ApprenticeshipQ QC

The use of equivalence mechanisms such as ECTS helps to facilitate the recognition and development of international cooperative training activities. The certification and recognition criterion is one of the most affected by ECTS. In ApprenticeshipQ, the credit granting mechanisms are not explicit in the different procedures, the time measure being drafted in a generic way. Moreover, learning outcomes must be specified as a function of time developed and the corresponding ECTS. A certification in ApprenticeshipQ could be defined that is based on the ECTS of the curriculum developed internationally which could be recognized as an international dual activity.

2.7 Diploma Supplement

2.7.1 About Diploma Supplement

“The Diploma Supplement is a document accompanying a higher education diploma providing a standardised description of the nature, level, content and status of the studies completed by its holder” (Communication department of the European Commission 2020c). It is produced by higher education institutions according to standards agreed and is also part of the Europass framework transparency tools. Furthermore, it is designed as an aid to support the recognition of academic qualifications and thus important tool of the European Higher Education Area for graduates to ensure that their degrees are recognised by higher education institutions, public authorities and employers in their home countries and abroad (ibid.).

2.7.2 Diploma Supplement relation with the ApprenticeshipQ QC

There is no conflict of intent between the ApprenticeshipQ materials and the Diploma supplement as the ApprenticeshipQ manuals are aimed at the organisational level for both HVET and SME and not towards the individual (which is the purpose of the Diploma Supplement). The manuals are mutually supportive and supplementary. The Diploma Supplement is a document, which accompanies a European higher education diploma/degree. Its sections offer a description of the nature, level, context, content and status of the studies completed by its holder. The Diploma Supplement relates to HE only and is issued by different HE institutions only. The tools serve a dissimilar purpose at different levels of post-school education.

2.8 European Framework for Quality and Effective Apprenticeships (EFQEA)

2.8.1 About EFQEA

The Council Recommendation of 15 March 2018 on a European Framework for Quality and Effective Apprenticeships (2018/C 153/01) aims at “increasing the employability and personal development of apprentices and contributing towards a highly skilled and qualified workforce responsive to labour market needs” (Topolovec 2018). The European Framework sets out 14 criteria: 7 for learning and working conditions and 7 for framework conditions (Council Recommendation of 15 March 2018 on a European Framework for Quality and Effective Apprenticeships OJ C 153, 2.5.2018, p. 1–6) to define quality and effective apprenticeships, ensuring both the development of job-related skills and the personal development of apprentices. The Framework takes into account the diversity of vocational education and training (VET) systems across the EU and respects the Member States' competence in the area of VET (Commission Spokesperson's Service 2017).

2.8.2 EFQEA relation with the ApprenticeshipQ QC

ApprenticeshipQ covers most of the features of EFQEA and contains many additional features. On the other hand, ApprenticeshipQ lacks holiday entitlement comparing to the EFQEA and lacks indicator trainings for supervisors in institution Chapter on Flexible pathways in EFQEA is broader than in ApprenticeshipQ (Criteria 11, Flexible pathways and mobility). EFQEA is also broader in covering national policy of career guidance. ApprenticeshipQ on the other hand covers institutional and operational level.

The tools somehow conflict in a sense that EFQEA is focussing on the learning outcomes rather than learning objectives (ApprenticeshipQ). Also, in higher education (EFQEA) curricula are not developed based on existing qualification standards and/or occupational profiles unlike in VET. Definition of apprenticeship is somehow different: EFQEA states that part of the apprenticeship should be carried out in the workplace whereas ApprenticeshipQ defines it as fully carried out in the workplace (for the same reason there is no school-based training encompassed).

3 Conclusions

The ApprenticeshipQ Quality Criteria (and the products based on them) constitute new tools to plan, manage, assure and evaluate the quality of curricular apprenticeships offered in partnership between educational institutions and the companies which provide the apprenticeship placements.

The ApprenticeshipQ Tool can be used by educational institutions (to plan, manage and assure their part of the operations and to evaluate their placement provider partners, as well as to, by their partner companies and by regulators.

Consultations were held with experts in several countries (Austria, Germany, Malta, Portugal, Slovenia, Spain, UK and in other EURASHE member states). These experts performed a point-by-point comparative analyses between the ApprenticeshipQ QC and other European and International tools (ECVET, EQF, ESG, ISO 21001, DP, ECTS, EQAVET, EFQEA). The results of the consultation, such as the identification of conflict and synergies between the tools and recommendations to improve harmonization, facilitate integration and boost adoption, were analysed and discussed by the consortium. The consensus reached was subsequently reflected in:

- a) the final review of the two ApprenticeshipQ Manuals (for educational organizations and for placement providers;
- b) the ApprenticeshipQ online assessment tool;
- c) the adaptation of the ApprenticeshipQ criteria to ISO terminology, writing style and format, with the purpose of publication by the Portuguese National Standardization Body (IPQ/CT 187, 2020) and to candidate it for future publication by ISO;
- d) the policy recommendations per ApprenticeshipQ Quality Criteria, cascaded for the European Commission, national governments, higher vocational education and training (HVET) associations, and employers.

These Policy Recommendations constitute a special section of the guide (Chapter 4), a separate output of the project, and will be distributed to decision and policy-makers with the support of the chamber of commerce and trade and EURASHE memberships.

Taken globally, the opinion of the experts consulted point out, in the analyses, to a low level of conflict, a high level of agreement and complementarity between the tools; and in the recommendations issued, to the advantages of using them together and improve even further their harmonization in the future.

4 Recommendations

Country	QC	Comment/Rationale	Proposed Recommendation	Partner agreement
SI	9. Establishing the Agreement	Financial remuneration for students and payment of apprenticeship.	A minimum that a student shall receive (meal vouchers and travel costs)	This is culturally and politically sensitive and varies per national context. Add as good practice.
SI	1. Involvement of Stakeholders in Designing Learning Objectives 2. Definition of SMART Learning Objectives	Simplifying and opening learning objectives in learning objectives catalogues.	that unified learning objectives be described in terms of knowledge, skills, responsibility and autonomy (or behaviour)?	Disagree. Unified is not added.
SI	1. Involvement of Stakeholders in Designing Learning Objectives; 20. Preparation for the Apprenticeship	Enterprises that include apprenticeships shall be automatically included in government incentives (e.g. entitled to funds, tax exemption ...), procedures shall be easily manageable	Introduce incentive scheme (QC1) Does the SME have a financial plan and/or allocation for apprenticeships, including incentive schemes? (QC20)	Great recommendation, but totally out of scope of this document, whose target are HVET and SME, none having legal/regulatory power to implement such measures. Note as recommendation Output 6 with conditions on how to spend the money
DE	All	ECVET encourages the initiation of a network to share your experience.	Development of an ApprenticeshipQ network	Agree. Interesting point but no time.

Country	QC	Comment/Rationale	Proposed Recommendation	Partner agreement
DE	18. Certification and Recognition	Both tools highlight the importance of validation and recognition of the learning goals/outcomes.	It could be beneficial to document these learning outcomes/goals in the new Europass.	Agree. Use as recommendation
DE	All	Is the learning during the apprenticeship somehow embedded into the learning at the educational institution?	Adding a practice – theory transfer.	Agree. Chapter 6
AT	All; 20. Preparation for the Apprenticeship	Has the SME a robust institutional and regulatory framework?	This indicator may be difficult to measure. Criteria for a robust institutional and regulatory framework?	It can be recommended but leave HEI and SME to decide.
AT	21.	Does a communication structure (...) exist, including: positive, trusting relationship (...) quick response time (...) student feels supported by the mentor	Important point – but again: may be difficult to measure. If possible, suggest to further define (e.g. what is a quick response time, how is it being assessed that a student feels supported by his/her mentor?)	It can be recommended but leave HEI and SME to decide.
AT	Supervisor and mentor capacity building	Teaching Staff	General comment: - Profile - Education - Professional experience	It can be recommended but leave HEI and SME to decide.
AT	Recognition for supervisors and mentors	Training and certification of the Mentors	General comment: The Mentors will have main responsibility for the QA in the SMEs and as such will need formal training and if possible certification by the HEIs	It can be recommended but leave HEI and SME to decide.

Country	QC	Comment/Rationale	Proposed Recommendation	Partner agreement
BE	ESG 1.1, 1.7 and 1.8; 10. Matching Students to Placements Related to 7. Management of Placement-Supply-Database	In this case, ESG 1.1 regarding the procedures for managing the database of students with their profiles and the list of available placements and ESG 1.7 Information management would apply. In addition, with regards to the information available for students, ESG 1.8 would also apply.	As this criterium and criterium 7 are quite related, maybe there could be just one of them regarding Matching students with placements which would cover everything related with matching the right student to the right placement.	Disagree as criterion 7 and 10 are two different phases.
MT	All	The two documents use different terminology	Harmonize AppQ terminology with ISO 21001 (and also ISO 9001) to facilitate integrated implementation both at HEIs and at SMEs.	Agree.
MT	8.5.5 Protection and transparency of learners' data; HEI #8 Data Protection	The two documents address the same subject, but in very different ways. ISO 21001 has much more prescriptive requirements in this subject. AppQ users can use ISO 21001 to fine tune their practices	Develop the requirement further at AppQ, based on ISO 21001 example.	Agree.
MT	8.5.1.4 Summative assessment; 8.5.2 Identification and traceability; 8.5.5 Protection and transparency of learners' data; HEI #16 Performing and Monitoring the Assessment	The two documents address the same subject, but in very different ways. ISO 21001 has much more prescriptive requirements in this subject. AppQ users can use ISO 21001 to fine tune their practices	Develop the requirements further at AppQ, based on ISO 21001 example.	Agree.

Country	QC	Comment/Rationale	Proposed Recommendation	Partner agreement
MT	8.5.1.5 Recognition of assessed learning; HEI #18 Certification and Recognition	The two documents address the same subject and they complement each other as both have more prescriptive requirements than the other in different aspects. ISO 21001 users can use AppQ to fine tune their practices and AppQ users can also use ISO 21001 to fine tune their practices.	Develop the requirement further at AppQ, based on ISO 21001 example.	Agree.
PT	4	The compliance of the criteria 4 can help the organizations in aligning their objectives with the policies defined for VET, namely by contributing to the fulfilment of legal requirements (the implementation of the apprenticeship - WBL of courses is defined and regulated in the current legislation)		Agree with comment. No recommendation provided.
PT	5	The compliance of the criteria 5 can help the organizations to align their objectives with the policies defined for VET, namely by contributing to the fulfilment of legal requirements (the implementation of the apprenticeship - WBL of courses is defined and regulated in the current legislation).		Agree with comment. No recommendation provided.

Country	QC	Comment/Rationale	Proposed Recommendation	Partner agreement
ES	All	The use of equivalence mechanisms such as ECTS helps to facilitate the recognition and development of international cooperative training activities.	The use of equivalence mechanisms such as ECTS helps to facilitate the recognition and development of international cooperative training activities and therefore should be used in different criteria.	Agree.
ES	18. Certification and Recognition	In our experience, the recognized credits and the corresponding time periods are not homogeneous among the HVETs of the different countries in Dual international activities.	The procedures must include the learning period developed and the corresponding credit recognition mechanism such as ECTS.	Agree.
ES	2. Definition of SMART Learning Objectives	Learning outcomes must be specified as a function of time developed but the equivalence mechanism is not defined.	The criterion must include the learning period developed and the corresponding credit recognition mechanism such as ECTS.	Agree.
ES	12. Monitoring of Student Activities	The monitoring of tasks and time must be consistent with the learning agreement (SMART Learning objectives).; In our case, the academic tutor verifies that the homework times are in accordance with the plan and the learning agreement ECTS recognition (mobility).; In the event of a problem, action must be taken as soon as possible.	The criterion must include the learning period developed and the corresponding credit recognition mechanism such as ECTS.	Agree.

Country	QC	Comment/Rationale	Proposed Recommendation	Partner agreement
ES	18. Certification and Recognition	A certification could be defined that is based on the ECTS of the curriculum developed internationally which could be recognized as an international dual activity.	Include as a measure indicator a method for allocating transferable credits in international cooperative training.	Agree.
UK	All	Cloud wished to check the way in which the QC would be finalised. The intent to create a formal tool that could be developed into ISO was explained.	There might be scope to refer to ECVET in some sections; e.g. section (18) on 'Certification and Recognition', which says 'Learning outcomes need to be certified to be able to be transferable and recognisable'), mentions briefly Europass but there's no reference to ECVET as a tool to record and certify credit for transfer	Agree.
SI	9. Establishing the Agreement; 22. Establishing the Agreement	AppQ lacks holiday entitlement. AppQ covers all other features of EFQEA and contains many additional features.	Add Measurement indicator "holiday entitlement" to AppQ QC 9.	Agree.
SI	All	Different terminology – learning outcome (EFQEA) / learning objective (AppQ)	Harmonize terminology.	Agree.
SI	4. Definition of Standards for Placements	Trainings for supervisors in institution.	Add measurement indicator "access and support to continuing training for supervisors in HVET institution".	Agree.

Country	QC	Comment/Rationale	Proposed Recommendation	Partner agreement
SI	1. Involvement of Stakeholders in Designing Learning Objectives	Different levels (e.g. national and regional levels) involved functions clearly defined and adequately allocated.	Add to QC 1.	Agree.
SI	6. Capacity building for SMEs	“Financial and/or non-financial support should be envisaged, particularly for micro-, small and medium-sized companies, enabling cost-effective apprenticeships for companies, taking into account, when appropriate, cost-sharing arrangements between employers and public authorities.”	Add cost-sharing agreements.	Agree.
SI	6. Capacity building for SMEs	Is there recognition, or even award, for companies that provide quality apprenticeships?	Add recognition and award, for companies that provide quality apprenticeships.	Agree.
SI	14. Evaluation of Apprenticeships	Tracking of employment and career progression.	Add graduate tracking.	Agree.
SI	4. Definition of Standards for Placements	Companies are subject to quality assurance inspections carried out by independent bodies.	Add quality assurance inspections by independent bodies.	Disagree.

QC¹ 1 - Involvement of Stakeholders in Designing Learning Outcomes

R² 1 - Establish and embed a sustainable structure on systemic level engaging all relevant umbrella stakeholders' representatives consulting and keeping records on regular basis (authorities, employers, HVET institutions, students).

Government	Employers	HVET Associations	European Commission
<p>Enable, promote, and support collaboration in curriculum design between employers, HVET institutions and students on national, regional, and local levels.</p> <p>Take on board stakeholders' proposals for needed systemic changes.</p> <p>Enable flexibility of study programmes to respond to the demands in the labour market.</p>	<p>Engage with HVET institutions and students in curriculum design.</p>	<p>Engage with employers and students in curriculum design.</p> <p>Motivate HVET institutions and students to engage.</p>	<p>Map engagement.</p> <p>Share practices at European level.</p> <p>Support member states in promoting interaction between stakeholders.</p>

¹ QC = ApprenticeshipQ quality criteria.

² R = Recommendation.

QC 2 - Definition of SMART Learning Outcomes

R 2 - Create a clear and comprehensive overview of SMART learning outcomes specifying learning outcomes in terms of knowledge, skills, competences, responsibility, and autonomy (or behaviour).

Government	Employers	HVET Associations	European Commission
Develop, support and update SMART learning outcomes in terms of knowledge, skills, competences, responsibility and autonomy (or behaviour).	Engage and contribute to regular update overview of SMART learning outcomes.	Engage and contribute to regular update overview of SMART learning outcomes. Support HVET institutions and students to engage. Support HVET institutions in adopting new approaches to achieving SMART learning outcomes.	Map development of SMART Learning Outcomes. Share practices at European level. Support member states in developing SMART Learning Outcomes.

QC 3 – Transparency

R 3 – Standards for apprenticeship requirements and assessment of learning outcomes are publicly available.

Government	Employers	HVET Associations	European Commission
Develop, monitor and update standards for apprenticeship requirements and assessment of learning outcomes and ensure these are publicly available	Engage and contribute to the development and update of standards for apprenticeship requirements and assessment of learning outcomes Collaborate with HVET institutions to ensure that standards for apprenticeship requirements are met	Engage and contribute to the development and update of standards for apprenticeship requirements and assessment of learning outcomes Support HVET institutions and students to engage. Support HVET institutions and employers to meet standards for apprenticeship requirements and assessment of learning outcomes.	Map apprenticeship requirements and assessment of learning outcomes. Share practices at European level.

QC 4 - Definition of Standards for Placements

R 4 – Create common standards, criteria and conditions for apprenticeships.

Government	Employers	HVET Associations	European Commission
Create common standards and criteria to award apprenticeship placements to companies.	Define requirements/profile for the apprenticeship mentor position.	Define requirements/profile for the apprenticeship supervisor position.	
Create common requirements to award apprenticeship supervisors and mentors.	Enable continuous training for apprenticeship mentors.	Create continuous training possibilities for apprenticeship supervisors and mentors.	
Establish recognition and progression path for apprenticeship supervisors.	Systemize mentor's workload.	Systemize supervisor's workload.	
Establish recognition and progression path for apprenticeship mentors.			

QC 5 - Identification (finding) of Placement-Positions

R 5 – Ensure constant promotion of apprenticeships.

Government	Employers	HVET Associations	European Commission
Provide systemic and regular incentives and support for employers offering apprenticeships.	Check incentives and support offered by government and HVET institutions.	Promote and advertise apprenticeship advantages. Offer support for employers offering apprenticeships. Organise/career open days for employers and students for possible matching.	

QC 6 - Capacity Building for SMEs

R 6 – Create supporting systems to build capacity in SMEs for apprenticeships.

Government	Employers	HVET Associations	European Commission
Create recognition and award possibilities for mentors.	Engage in capacity building events provided by HVET institutions.	Prepare information and supporting materials and events for employers and mentors' capacity building.	

QC 7 - Management of Placement-Supply-Database

R 7 – Create systems that support the management of apprenticeships by matching apprentices with placements

Government	Employers	HVET Associations	European Commission
Collect metadata indicating trends and gaps in the labour market and the need for study programmes adaptation and to direct investment and support.	Collect metadata indicating trends and gaps in the labour market in terms of labour and skills shortages	Collect metadata indicating trends and gaps in the labour market and the need for study programmes adaptation.	Collect metadata indicating trends and gaps in the labour market to direct investment and support.

QC 8 - Data Protection

R 8 – Ensure data protection prior to, throughout and after the apprenticeship

Government	Employers	HVET Associations	European Commission
Enable, promote, and support collaboration between employers and HVET institutions on data protection Monitor implementation of data protection measures	Collaborate with HVET institutions on developing robust data protection mechanisms	Collaborate with employers on developing robust data protection mechanisms	

QC 9 - Establishing the Agreement

R 9 – Develop an agreement between stakeholders that outlines the responsibilities of each stakeholder

Government	Employers	HVET Associations	European Commission
Enable, promote, and support collaboration between employers, HVET institutions and students on developing model contracts outlining the responsibilities of each stakeholder during the apprenticeship	Collaborate with HVET associations and institutions on developing model contracts outlining the responsibilities of each stakeholder during the apprenticeship	Collaborate with employers on developing model contracts outlining the responsibilities of each stakeholder during the apprenticeship	

QC 10 - Matching Apprentices' to Placements

R 10 – Develop and maintain a list of suitable available placements

Government	Employers	HVET Associations	European Commission
Enable, promote, and support collaboration between employers and HVET institutions in developing effective mechanisms to match apprentices to placements at national, regional, and local levels.	Collaborate with HVET Associations and HVET institutions in providing information on available apprenticeship placements	Collaborate with employers in providing information on required apprenticeship placements	Map effective mechanisms for matching apprenticeships to placements. Share practices at European level.

QC 11 - Monitoring of SMEs Activities

R 11 – Monitor the implementation of the apprenticeship at the SME to foster continuous improvement

Government	Employers	HVET Associations	European Commission
Enable, promote, and support collaboration between employers and HVET institutions in developing effective monitoring mechanisms and tools	Collaborate with HVET institutions in developing suitable monitoring mechanisms and tools Appoint mentor for monitoring each apprenticeship	Collaborate with employers in developing suitable monitoring mechanisms and tools Appoint supervisor for monitoring each apprenticeship	Map effective mechanisms and tools for monitoring apprenticeships Share practices at European level.

QC 12 - Monitoring of Apprentices Activities

R 12 - Monitor the activities of the apprentice to foster continuous improvement

Government	Employers	HVET Associations	European Commission
Enable, promote, and support collaboration between employers and HVET institutions in developing effective monitoring mechanisms and tools	Collaborate with HVET institutions in developing suitable monitoring mechanisms and tools Appoint mentor for monitoring the apprentice	Collaborate with employers in developing suitable monitoring mechanisms and tools Appoint supervisor for monitoring the apprentice	Map effective mechanisms and tools for monitoring apprenticeships Share practices at European level.

QC 13 - User Support and Issue Resolution

R 13 – Create a helpdesk as a contact point for technical difficulties

Government	Employers	HVET Associations	European Commission
		<p>Create a helpdesk for technical difficulties and ensure information and contact details are easily accessible</p> <p>Develop information material related to resolving technical issues</p>	

QC 14 - Evaluation of Apprenticeships

R 14 – Develop robust evaluation mechanisms of apprenticeships to aid assessment and foster continuous improvement

Government	Employers	HVET Associations	European Commission
Create common standards and criteria for the evaluation of apprenticeships	Ensure consistent implementation of evaluation mechanisms of the apprenticeship by employer	Ensure consistent implementation of evaluation mechanisms of the apprenticeship by employer	Map effective mechanisms for evaluating apprenticeships and graduate tracking
Enable, promote, and support collaboration between employers and HVET institutions in developing and implementing standards and criteria		Ensure monitoring of apprentices after graduation (graduate tracking)	Share practices at European level.
Support graduate tracking of apprentices			

QC 15 - Assessment Design

R 15 – Develop formal and informal assessment designs that illustrate learning development

Government	Employers	HVET Associations	European Commission
	Collaborate with the HVET institution in drawing up the assessment design and templates in line with SMART Learning Outcomes	Collaborate with employers in drawing up the assessment design and templates in line with SMART Learning Outcomes	
	Collaborate with HVET institutions in drawing up assessment criteria and rubric in line with SMART Learning Outcomes	Collaborate with employers in drawing up assessment criteria and rubric in line with SMART Learning Outcomes	

QC 16 - Performing and Monitoring the Assessment

R 16 – Consistent implementation and monitoring of the assessment

Government	Employers	HVET Associations	European Commission
	<p>Collaborate with HVET institutions on the consistent implementation and monitoring of the implementation of the assessment process and criteria</p> <p>Provide training to mentors and other staff involved by the placement provider in the assessment process on how to implement assessment processes consistently</p>	<p>Collaborate with placement provider on the consistent implementation and monitoring of the implementation of the assessment process and criteria</p> <p>Provide training to supervisors and other staff involved at the HVET institution in the assessment process on how to implement assessment processes consistently</p>	

QC 17 – Grading

R 17 – Develop a standardized grading system

Government	Employers	HVET Associations	European Commission
	<p>Collaborate with HVET institutions on the development, consistent implementation and monitoring of a standardised grading system</p> <p>Provide training to staff involved in the grading process from the placement provider on how to consistently implement the grading system</p>	<p>Collaborate with placement providers on the development, consistent implementation and monitoring of a standardised grading system</p> <p>Provide training to staff involved in the grading process from the HVET institution on how to consistently implement the grading system</p>	

QC 18 - Certification and Recognition

R 18 – Use ECTS to facilitate the recognition and development of international cooperative training activities

Government	Employers	HVET Associations	European Commission
<p>Enable, promote, and support the use of ECTS in apprenticeships to foster certification and recognition</p> <p>Support employers, HVET institutions and students in applying ECTS to apprenticeships</p> <p>Support HVET institutions and students in developing mechanisms and tools for the recognition of prior learning</p>	<p>Collaborate with HVET institutions and students on applying ECTS to apprenticeships</p> <p>Collaborate with HVET institutions and students in developing mechanisms for the recognition of prior learning</p> <p>Collaborate with HVET institutions in issuing an apprenticeship supplement documenting the learning that has taken place in line with SMART Learning Outcomes</p>	<p>Collaborate with employers and students on applying ECTS to apprenticeships</p> <p>Collaborate with employers and students in developing mechanisms for the recognition of prior learning</p> <p>Collaborate with employers in issuing an apprenticeship supplement documenting the learning that has taken place in line with SMART Learning Outcomes</p>	<p>Map the use of ECTS in apprenticeships</p> <p>Share practices at European level.</p>

QC 19 - Complaints and Appeals

R 19 – Develop robust policies and procedures for dealing with complaints and appeals

Government	Employers	HVET Associations	European Commission
	<p>Collaborate with HVET institutions and students in developing, implementing and monitoring policies and procedures for dealing with complaints and appeals</p> <p>Provide training to mentors on how to deal with complaints and appeals</p> <p>Ensure policies and procedures are transparent and information easily available to apprentices</p>	<p>Collaborate with employers and students in developing, implementing and monitoring policies and procedures for dealing with complaints and appeals</p> <p>Provide training to supervisors on how to deal with complaints and appeals</p> <p>Ensure policies and procedures are transparent and information easily available to apprentices</p>	

QC 20 - Preparation for the Apprenticeship

R 20 – Ensure all necessary documentary information is in place before the commencement of the apprenticeship

Government	Employers	HVET Associations	European Commission
	<p>Develop policies and procedures regarding documentary evidence to be in place before commencement of the apprenticeship</p> <p>Provide training to mentors and other relevant staff involved in the preparation of the apprenticeship in drawing up required documentation</p> <p>Ensure information is transparent, easily accessible and easy to understand for apprentices</p>		

QC 21 - Identifying Mentors

R 21 – Identify and train mentors for apprenticeships

Government	Employers	HVET Associations	European Commission
	<p>Develop a profile of apprenticeship mentors</p> <p>Promote mentorship among employers</p> <p>Provide training for mentors to fulfil their role effectively</p> <p>Collaborate with HVET institutions on the expectations towards mentors, supervisors and other staff involved in implementing the apprenticeship</p>	<p>Collaborate with employers on the expectations towards mentors, supervisors and other staff involved in implementing the apprenticeship</p>	

QC 22 - Establishing the Agreement

R 22 - Develop policies and procedures for drawing up an apprenticeship agreement that meets the needs of all stakeholders involved

Government	Employers	HVET Associations	European Commission
Enable, promote, and support collaboration between employers, HVET institutions and students in developing apprenticeship agreements that meet the needs of all stakeholders	Develop and implement policies and procedures on drawing up an apprenticeship agreement together with HVET institutions and students that meet the needs of all stakeholders	Develop and implement policies and procedures on drawing up an apprenticeship agreement together with employers and students that meet the needs of all stakeholders	

QC 23 - Matching Apprentices' with Placements

R 23 – Ensure that apprenticeship placements meet the needs of all stakeholders involved including knowledge, skills and competences of the apprentice prior to the placement, learning outcomes of the apprenticeship and link to the curriculum

Government	Employers	HVET Associations	European Commission
Enable, promote, and support collaboration between employers, HVET institutions and students in drawing up a learning agreement	Collaborate with HVET institutions and students in drawing up a learning agreement that outlines the work experience to be attained through the apprenticeship based on SMART Learning Outcomes and its link to the curriculum	Collaborate with employers and students in drawing up a learning agreement that outlines the work experience to be attained through the apprenticeship based on SMART Learning Outcomes and its link to the curriculum	

QC 24 - Conditions of the Apprenticeship

R 24 – Ensure conditions of the apprenticeship are transparent and documented including defined time of work, salary, crisis management, work place, learning outcomes, mentor, communication, work plan and a clear link to the curriculum

Government	Employers	HVET Associations	European Commission
	Collaborate with HVET institutions and students in in drawing up an apprenticeship agreement that outlines the conditions of the apprenticeship	Collaborate with HVET institutions and students in in drawing up an apprenticeship agreement that outlines the conditions of the apprenticeship	

QC 25 - Integration of the Apprentice

R 25 – Provide induction for the apprentice

Government	Employers	HVET Associations	European Commission
	<p>Collaborate with HVET institutions, mentors and supervisors in developing an induction programme for the apprentice</p> <p>Train mentors and all staff involved at the placement provider on how to deliver the induction programme</p>	<p>Collaborate with employers, mentors and supervisors in preparing apprentices for the apprenticeship</p> <p>Train supervisors and all staff involved at the HVET institution in supporting apprentices in preparation, implementation and follow-up of the apprenticeship</p>	

QC 26 – Mentoring

R 26 – Empower mentors in supporting apprentices throughout the apprenticeship

Government	Employers	HVET Associations	European Commission
	<p>Develop policies and procedures on implementation, monitoring and evaluation of the work of mentors in collaboration with HVET institutions</p> <p>Provide continuous support and training to mentors</p>	<p>Develop policies and procedures on implementation, monitoring and evaluation of the work of mentors in collaboration with employers</p>	

QC 27 - Records of Apprenticeships

R 27 – Maintain adequate records of the apprenticeship

Government	Employers	HVET Associations	European Commission
Create common policies and standards for records to be kept of apprenticeships in consultation with employers and HVET institutions in line with Data Protection regulations	Ensure consistent implementation of the policies and standards of record retention regarding the apprenticeship in line with Data Protection regulations and consultation with HVET institutions	Ensure consistent implementation of the policies and standards of record retention regarding the apprenticeship in line with Data Protection regulations and consultation with employers	

QC 28 - Assessment of Learning

R 28 – Develop adequate formal and informal assessment methods to ensure attainment of the SMART Learning Outcomes

Government	Employers	HVET Associations	European Commission
Enable, promote, and support collaboration between employers and HVET institutions in developing adequate assessment methods	Collaborate with HVET institutions in developing formal and informal assessment methods that measure attainment of the SMART Learning Outcomes and are suited to the apprenticeship in question Clearly outline the roles of individuals involved in the assessment process Provide training to relevant staff at the placement provider involved in the assessment to ensure consistent implementation	Collaborate with employers in developing formal and informal assessment methods that measure attainment of the SMART Learning Outcomes and are suited to the apprenticeship in question Clearly outline the roles of individuals involved in the assessment process Support placement providers in providing training to relevant staff at the placement provider involved in the assessment to ensure consistent implementation	

QC 29 - Evaluation of Process

R 29 – Develop continuous evaluation mechanisms that foster quality improvement

Government	Employers	HVET Associations	European Commission
	<p>Develop effective, continuous evaluation mechanisms that contribute to quality improvement throughout the apprenticeship in close consultation with HVET institutions</p> <p>Provide training to mentors and relevant staff at the placement provider to implement the evaluation mechanisms</p>	<p>Develop effective, continuous evaluation mechanisms that contribute to quality improvement throughout the apprenticeship in close consultation with employers</p>	

QC 30 - Quality Management Procedures

R 30 – Develop robust quality management policies and procedures for the effective implementation of the apprenticeship

Government	Employers	HVET Associations	European Commission
Support employers, HVET institutions and students in developing and implementing robust quality management policies and procedures	Collaborate with HVET institutions and students in developing, implementing and monitoring quality management policies and procedures Provide training to all staff involved at placement providers in implementing the quality management policies and procedures Ensure policies and procedures are transparent and information easily available to apprentices	Collaborate with employers and students in developing, implementing and monitoring quality management policies and procedures Provide training to all staff involved in the HVET institution in implementing the quality management policies and procedures Ensure policies and procedures are transparent and information easily available to apprentices	Map quality management procedures in apprenticeships Share practices at European level.

5 References

Association HVC (2017). *APPRENTICESHIPQ*. Accessed at: <https://www.skupnost-vss.si/en/apprenticeshipq/>

Atack, Patrick (2020). *What is the European Credit Transfer System (ECTS)?*. Accessed at: <https://www.study.eu/article/what-is-the-ects-european-credit-transfer-and-accumulation-system>

Cedefop (2020a). *European credit system for vocational education and training (ECVET)*. Accessed at: <https://www.cedefop.europa.eu/en/events-and-projects/projects/european-credit-system-vocational-education-and-training-ecvet>

Cedefop (2020b). *European qualifications framework (EQF)*. Accessed at: <https://www.cedefop.europa.eu/en/events-and-projects/projects/european-qualifications-framework-eqf>

Commission Spokesperson's Service (2017). *European Framework for Quality and Effective Apprenticeships: Questions and Answers*. Accessed at: https://ec.europa.eu/commission/presscorner/detail/en/MEMO_17_3586

Communication department of the European Commission (2020a). *Description of the eight EQF levels*. Accessed at: <https://europa.eu/europass/sl/description-eight-eqf-levels>

Communication department of the European Commission (2020b). *European Credit Transfer and Accumulation System (ECTS)*. Accessed at: https://ec.europa.eu/education/resources-and-tools/european-credit-transfer-and-accumulation-system-ects_en

Communication department of the European Commission (2020c). *Diploma Supplement*. Accessed at: https://ec.europa.eu/education/diploma-supplement_en

Council Recommendation of 15 March 2018 on a European Framework for Quality and Effective Apprenticeships OJ C 153, 2.5.2018, p. 1–6ENQA, ESU, EUA, EURASHE, EI, BUSINESSEUROPE and EQUAR (2015). *Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area (ESG)*. Brussels, Belgium. Accessed at: https://enqa.eu/wp-content/uploads/2015/11/ESG_2015.pdf

EQAVET (2020a). *Mission*. Accessed at: <https://www.eqavet.eu/About-Us/Mission>

European Commission (2017). *High-performance apprenticeships & work-based learning - 20 guiding principles*. Accessed at: <https://op.europa.eu/en/publication-detail/-/publication/8f010ea2-265b-11e7-ab65-01aa75ed71a1/language-en/format-PDF/source-63634090#>

Inter-agency Group on Technical and Vocational Education and Training (2017). *Investing in work-based learning*. Accessed at: <http://unesdoc.unesco.org/images/0026/002606/260677E.pdf>

IPQ/CT 187 (2020). *Plano de Atividades 2020*. IPQ intranet document.

ISO (2012). *The ISO Survey 2012*. Accessed at: <https://isotc.iso.org/livelink/livelink?func=ll&objId=18808108&objAction=Open&nexturl=%2F%2Flivelink%2F%2Flivelink%3Ffunc%3D%26objId%3D21413346%26objAction%3Dbrowse%26viewType%3D1>

ISO (2013). *ISO/TMB Resolution 101/2013: Establishing PC 288 on Educational organizations management systems - Requirements with guidance for use*. ISO intranet document.

ISO (2013b). *The ISO Survey 2013*. Accessed at: <https://isotc.iso.org/livelink/livelink?func=ll&objId=18808108&objAction=Open&nexturl=%2F%2Flivelink%2F%2Flivelink%3Ffunc%3D%26objId%3D21413346%26objAction%3Dbrowse%26viewType%3D1>

ISO (2014). *The ISO Survey 2014*. Accessed at: <https://isotc.iso.org/livelink/livelink?func=ll&objId=18808108&objAction=Open&nexturl=%2F%2Flivelink%2F%2Flivelink%3Ffunc%3D%26objId%3D21413346%26objAction%3Dbrowse%26viewType%3D1>

ISO (2018a). Educational organization management systems. *In ISO 21001 Briefing Notes*. Accessed at: https://www.iso.org/files/live/sites/isoorg/files/developing_standards/docs/en/ISO_21001_Briefing_Notes.pdf

ISO (2018b). *ISO 21001:2018 Educational organizations – Management systems for educational organizations – Requirements with guidance for use - Abstract*. Accessed at: <https://www.iso.org/standard/66266.html>

ISO (2018c). *ISO 21001:2018 Educational organizations – Management systems for educational organizations – Requirements with guidance for use*. ISO: Geneva.

OECD (2018). *Seven Questions about Apprenticeships: Answers from International Experience*. OECD Reviews of Vocational Education and Training, OECD Publishing, Paris. Accessed at: <https://doi.org/10.1787/9789264306486-en>

ApprenticeshipQ Consortium (2020). *Managing apprenticeships quality*. Accessed at: <https://apprenticeshipq.eu/about-the-project/>

Topolovec, Mihael (2018). *European Framework for Quality and Effective Apprenticeships*. Accessed at: <https://ec.europa.eu/esf/transnationality/content/european-framework-quality-and-effective-apprenticeships>

6 Annexes

6.1 Annex I: Analysis of the tool ECVET

Table 1: ECVET relation with the ApprenticeshipQ Criteria

Tool	Section in ECVET	ApprenticeshipQ Criteria	How it relates		Description	Recommendation
			Contribute / Complement	Conflict		
ECVET	All	All		X	<i>ECVET is focussing on the learning outcomes rather than learning goals</i>	No change to the AppQ criteria. ECVET is focussing on apprenticeships of the EQF level 4, whereas ApprenticeshipQ is focussing on the EQF levels 5 and 6.
	A	1. Involvement of Stakeholders	X		<i>Both tools stress the importance of a shared understanding of defined learning outcomes.</i>	
		2. Definition of Learning Objectives				
	B	3. Transparency	X		<i>Both tools highlight the importance of transparency that all stakeholders are on the same page.</i>	
	C	9. Establishing the Agreement	X		<i>In both tools, an agreement shall document the apprenticeship,</i>	
		21. Identifying Mentors				

Tool	Section in ECVET	ApprenticeshipQ Criteria	How it relates		Description	Recommendation
			Contribute / Complement	Conflict		
		22. Establishing the Agreement			including dates, learning outcomes, tasks, work space, mentoring	
	D	17. Grading	X		Both tools record, evaluate and document the learning outcomes/goals	
		27. Records of Apprenticeships				
		28. Assessment of Learning				
	E	18. Certification and Recognition	X		In both tools, the learning outcomes shall be validated and recognised.	
	F	3. Transparency	X		ECVET stresses the importance of a trusting relationship between all stakeholders.	
		13. User Support and Issue Resolution			In AppQ the importance of a relationship, the involvement of all stakeholders and the communication between them is part of several QC.	
		19. Complaints and Appeals				
	G	All	X		ECVET encourages the initiation of a network to share your experience.	Development of an ApprenticeshipQ network
	H	29. Evaluation of Process	X		Both tools are evaluating the process	
ECVET	All	All		X	ECVET is describing learning outcomes to highlight an orientation towards the learning products (asking the question: what would a company spend money on it?).	No change to the AppQ criteria. ECVET is focussing on apprenticeships of the EQF level 4, whereas ApprenticeshipQ is focussing on the EQF levels 5 and 6.
					AppQ is focussing on learning goals.	

Tool	Section in ECVET	ApprenticeshipQ Criteria	How it relates		Description	Recommendation
			Contribute / Complement	Conflict		
	A	2. Definition of SMART Learning Objectives	X		<i>The German Qualifications Framework clearly formulates the vocational competence to act. A strong focus should be placed here.</i>	
	B	3. Transparency	X		<i>Personal skills are important to mention here.</i>	
	F	18. Certification and Recognition	X		<i>Both tools highlight the importance of validation and recognition of the learning goals/outcomes.</i>	It could be beneficial to document these learning outcomes/goals in the new Europass.
ECVET	All	All		X	<i>ECVET is focussing on the transferability of learning outcomes, in particular for mobility project.</i> <i>Nevertheless this focus, the ECVET criteria match the quality criteria quite well.</i>	
	All	All	X		<i>Instead of presenting the criteria as a list, outline the quality criteria as a process.</i>	
	A	1. Involvement of Stakeholders		X	<i>ECVET is a lot shorter and does not encompass as many quality criteria as the AppQ.</i>	
		2. Definition of Learning Objectives			<i>Nevertheless, the EQF focus is different (4 vs. 5 and 6), therefore, no change is needed.</i>	
	C and D	9. Establishing the Agreement	X		<i>ECVET is focussing on competences gained during the apprentice.</i>	Add a MI documenting the competences, an apprentice had before the apprenticeships, which
		21. Identifying Mentors				

Tool	Section in ECVET	ApprenticeshipQ Criteria	How it relates		Description	Recommendation
			Contribute / Complement	Conflict		
		22. Establishing the Agreement				competences he or she should gain during the apprenticeship and which competences were gained after completing the apprenticeship.
		17. Grading				
		27. Records of Apprenticeships				
		28. Assessment of Learning				
	E	18. Certification and Recognition	X		ECVET stresses the importance of documenting the learning outcomes and competences gained.	To validate the learning goals a MI about comparing the targeted learning goals and achieved learning outcomes as well as competences could be added.
	All	All	X		Is the learning during the apprenticeship somehow embedded into the learning at the educational institution?	Adding a practice – theory transfer.

6.2 Annex II: Analysis of the tool EQF

Table 2: EQF relation with the ApprenticeshipQ Criteria

Tool	Section	ApprenticeshipQ Criteria	How it relates		Description	Recommendation
			Contribute / Complement	Conflict		
EQF	All	20	X		<i>Has the SME a robust institutional and regulatory framework?</i>	This indicator may be difficult to measure. Criteria for a robust institutional and regulatory framework?
EQF	All	21	X		<i>Does a communication structure (...) exist, including: positive, trusting relationship (...) quick response time (..) student feels supported by the mentor</i>	Important point – but again: may be difficult to measure. If possible, suggest to further define (e.g. what is a quick response time, how is it being assessed that a student feels supported by his/her mentor?)
EQF	All	Next Criteria (HVET-HEIs)	X		Teaching Staff	General comment:
						Profile
						1. Education
						2. Professional experience
EQF	All	Next Criteria (Joint HVET- HEIS and SMS)	X		Training and certification of the Mentors	General comment: The Mentors will have main responsibility for the QA in the SMEs and as such will need formal training and if possible certification by the HEIs

6.3 Annex III: Analysis of the tool ESG

Table 3: ESG relation with the ApprenticeshipQ Criteria

Tool	Section	ApprenticeshipQ Criteria	How it relates		Description	Recommendation
			Contribute / Complement	Conflict		
Quality Apprentices at HVETs						
ESG	ESG 1.2	1. Involvement of Stakeholders in Designing Learning Objectives	Inline		The guidelines in ESG 1.1 establish that “The policy [for quality assurance] translates into practice through a variety of internal quality assurance processes that allow participation across the institution...The quality assurance policy also covers any elements of an institution’s activities that are subcontracted to or carried out by other parties.”	-
ESG	ESG 1.2	2.Definition of SMART Learning Objectives	Inline		The design of the Learning Outcomes is covered in ESG 1.2 Design and approval of programmes. ESG 1.2 and criterium 2 are in line with the design of SMART learning objectives, although the ESG is not so explicit in the definition of the objectives.	-
ESG	ESG 1.8	3.Transparency	Inline		ESG 1.8 is related to the communication of the information on the study programme “Institution should publish information about their activities which is clear, accurate, objective, up-to-date and readily accessible.”	-
ESG	ESG 1.1	4.Definition of Standards for Placements	Inline		ESG 1.1 establishes that “The policy for QA translates into practice through a variety of internal quality assurance processes that allow participation across the institution...The QA policy also covers any elements of an institution’s activities that are subcontracted to or carried out by other parties.” this	-

Tool	Section	ApprenticeshipQ Criteria	How it relates		Description	Recommendation
			Contribute / Complement	Conflict		
					<i>means that the QA policy of PHEI should cover the definition of standards for placements, involving all stakeholders.</i>	
ESG	ESG 1.1 and 1.3	5.Identification (finding) of Placement-Positions	Inline		<i>ESG 1.1 establishes that “The policy translates into practice through a variety of internal QA processes that allow participation across the institution...The QA policy also covers any elements of an institution’s activities that are subcontracted to or carried out by other parties.” This means that Institutions QA policy should cover the definition of standards for placements, which should include the identification (finding) of place-positions.</i>	-
					<i>ESG 1.3 establishes that “Institutions should ensure that the programmes are delivered in a way that encourages students to take an active role in creating the learning process”... so, the appropriate placement position is important criteria to comply.</i>	
ESG	ESG 1.9	6.Capacity building for SMEs	Inline		<i>ESG 1.9 establishes that “Institutions should periodically review their programmes to ensure that they achieve the objectives set for them and to respond to the needs of students and society...”, so this reflection should assure the proper focus on the employer's needs.</i>	-
ESG	ESG 1.1	7.Management of Placement-Supply- Database	Inline		<i>ESG 1.1 establish the procedures for information management. Effective information management about study programmes and other activities feed into the internal quality assurance system.</i>	-
ESG	ESG 1.1 and 1.7	8.Data Protection	Complement		<i>ESG does not cover the actual approach to data protection, however, any information management is covered by ESG 1.1 and 1.7.</i>	-

Tool	Section	ApprenticeshipQ Criteria	How it relates		Description	Recommendation
			Contribute / Complement	Conflict		
ESG	-	9.Establishing the Agreement	Complement		<i>This quality criterion can be related to ESG 1.3 but is out of ESG.</i>	-
ESG	ESG 1.4	10.Matching Students to Placements	Inline		<i>ESG 1.4 establishes that “Institutions should consistently apply pre-defined and published regulations covering all phases of the student “life cycle”, e.g. student admission, progression, recognition and certification”. So, this approach should cover the assurance of the relevant student placements.</i>	-
ESG	-	11.Monitoring of SMEs Activities	Complement		<i>This quality criterium is actually out of ESG.</i>	-
ESG	ESG 1.4	12.Monitoring of Student Activities	Inline		<i>This quality criterium is related to ESG 1.4 which states that “Institutions need to put in place both processes and tools to collect, monitor and act on information on student progression”.</i>	-
ESG	ESG 1.4	13.User Support and Issue Resolution	Inline		<i>This quality criterium is related to ESG 1.4 which states that “Institutions need to put in place both processes and tools to collect, monitor and act on information on student progression”.</i>	-
ESG	ESG 1.9	14.Evaluation of Apprenticeships	Inline		<i>ESG 1.9 establishes that “Institutions should periodically review their programmes to ensure that they achieve the objectives set for them and to respond to the needs of students and society...”, so this should assure the fair evaluation of apprenticeships as well.</i>	-
ESG	ESG 1.3	15.Assessment design	Inline		<i>Comply with ESG 1.3 that states “Considering the importance of assessment for the students’ progression and their future careers, quality assurance processes for assessment take into account the following:</i>	-

Tool	Section	ApprenticeshipQ Criteria	How it relates		Description	Recommendation
			Contribute / Complement	Conflict		
					<ul style="list-style-type: none"> -Assessors are familiar with existing testing and examination methods and receive support in developing their skills in this field; -The criteria for and method of assessment, as well as criteria for marking, are published in advance; -The assessment allows students to demonstrate the extent to which the intended learning outcomes have been achieved. Students are given feedback, which, if necessary, is linked to advising on the learning process; -Where possible, assessment is carried out by more than one examiner; -The regulations for assessment take into account mitigating circumstances; -Assessment is consistent, fairly applied to all students and carried out in accordance with the stated procedures; -A formal procedure for student appeals is in place." 	
ESG	-	16.Performing and Monitoring the Assessment	Complement		Out of ESG.	-
ESG	ESG 1.4 related	17.Grading	Complement		There is no specific mention to grading on the ESG, but it can be related to the assessment.	-
ESG	ESG 1.4	18.Certification and Recognition	Inline		ESG 1.4. states that "Institutions should consistently apply pre-defined and published regulations covering all phases of the student "life cycle", e.g. student admission, progression, recognition and certification." and "Fair recognition of higher education qualifications, periods of study and prior learning, including the recognition of non-formal and informal	-

Tool	Section	ApprenticeshipQ Criteria	How it relates		Description	Recommendation
			Contribute / Complement	Conflict		
					<i>learning, are essential components for ensuring the students' progress in their studies while promoting mobility". Graduation represents the final stage of the students' "life cycle.</i>	
ESG	-	19.Complaints and Appeals	Complement		Out of ESG.	-
Quality Apprentices at SMEs						
ESG	ESG 1.3	20.Preparation for the Apprenticeship	Inline		<i>ESG 1.3 establishes that "Institutions should ensure that the programmes are delivered in a way that encourages students to take an active role in creating the learning process"... so, the appropriate and properly prepared placement is important criteria to comply.</i>	-
ESG	ESG 1.3	21.Identifying Mentors	Inline		<i>ESG 1.3 not directly applies for external stakeholders, but it could be considered that for mentors could be the same approach like applies for academic staff within the higher education institution, the student-centred learning approach including.</i>	-
ESG	-	22.Establishing the Agreement	Complements		Out of ESG.	-
ESG	ESG 1.4	23.Matching Students with Placements	Inline		See criterium 10.	-
ESG	ESG 1.4	24.Conditions for the apprenticeship	Inline		See criterium 20.	<i>This criterium might be included in criterium 20.</i>
ESG	ESG 1.3	25.Integration of the apprentice	Inline		<i>The student should be the main focus of the apprenticeship following the student-centred approach.</i>	-

Tool	Section	ApprenticeshipQ Criteria	How it relates		Description	Recommendation
			Contribute / Complement	Conflict		
ESG	ESG 1.3	26.Mentoring	Inline		ESG 1.3 includes the relationship between students and teachers/mentors and describes the processes in the apprentice place.	-
ESG	ESG 1.4	27.Records of Apprenticeships	Inline		ESG 1.4 states “Institutions need to put in place both processes and tools to collect, monitor and act on information on student progression.”	-
ESG	ESG 1.3	28.Assessment of learning	Inline		Comply with ESG 1.3 that states “Considering the importance of assessment for the students’ progression and their future careers, quality assurance processes for assessment take into account the following:	-
					- Assessors are familiar with existing testing and examination methods and receive support in developing their skills in this field;	
		Also related to:			- The criteria for and method of assessment as well as criteria for marking are published in advance;	
		11.Monitoring of SMEs Activities,			- The assessment allows students to demonstrate the extent to which the intended learning outcomes have been achieved. Students are given feedback, which, if necessary, is linked to advice on the learning process;	
		14.Evaluation of Apprenticeships, and 15.Assessment design			- Where possible, assessment is carried out by more than one examiner;	
					- The regulations for assessment take into account mitigating circumstances;	
					- Assessment is consistent, fairly applied to all students and carried out in accordance with the stated procedures;	

Tool	Section	ApprenticeshipQ Criteria	How it relates		Description	Recommendation
			Contribute / Complement	Conflict		
					- A formal procedure for student appeals is in place."	
ESG	ESG 1.9	29.Evaluation of process	Inline		ESG 1.9 states that "Institutions should periodically review their programmes to ensure that they achieve the objectives set for them and to respond to the needs of students and society...", so this reflection should assure the fair evaluation process.	-
		Also related to:				
		11.Monitoring of SMEs Activities,				
		14.Evaluation of Apprenticeships				
ESG	ESG 1.1	30.Quality Management Procedures	Inline		ESG 1.1 establishes that "The policy for QA translates into practice through a variety of internal quality assurance processes that allow participation across the institution...The QA policy also covers any elements of an institution's activities that are subcontracted to or carried out by other parties." this means that the QA policy of PHEI should cover the definition of standards for placements, involving all stakeholders.	-
Quality Apprentices at HVETs						
ESG	ESG 1.1 and 1.2	1. Involvement of Stakeholders in Designing Learning Objectives	In line		As a general approach, the guidelines in ESG 1.1 Policy for Quality Assurance establish that "The policy [for quality assurance] translates into practice through a variety of internal quality assurance processes that allow participation across the institution...The quality assurance policy also covers any elements of an institution's activities that are subcontracted to or carried out by other parties." this would mean that the quality assurance policy of the institution should cover the designing of placements including their learning objectives, involving all stakeholders. The design of the Learning Outcomes is covered in ESG 1.2 Design	-

Tool	Section	ApprenticeshipQ Criteria	How it relates		Description	Recommendation
			Contribute / Complement	Conflict		
					<i>and approval of programmes. The guidelines in this standard establish that "Programmes are designed with overall programme objectives that are in line with the institutional strategy; and have explicit intended learning outcomes; are designed by involved students and other stakeholders in the work; ...include well-structured placement opportunities where appropriate; ..." So, ESG 1.2 and criterium 1 are in line regarding the involvement of stakeholders in designing learning objectives, considering learning objectives and learning outcomes as similar concepts.</i>	
ESG	ESG 1.2	2.Definition of SMART Learning Objectives	In line		<i>As commented in the previous criterium, the design of the Learning Outcomes is covered in ESG 1.2 Design and approval of programmes. The guidelines in this standard establish that "Programmes are designed with overall programme objectives that are in line with the institutional strategy; and have explicit intended learning outcomes; are designed by involved students and other stakeholders in the work; ...include well-structured placement opportunities where appropriate; ..." So ESG 1.2 and criterium 2 are in line regarding the design of SMART learning objectives, although the ESG are not so explicit in the definition of the objectives.</i>	-
ESG	ESF 1.3 and 1.8	3.Transparency	In line		<i>The first one (1.3) more related with students, learning objectives and their assessment "The criteria for and method of assessment as well as criteria for marking are published in advance"; and the second one (1.8) more related with the communication of all the information regarding the study programme</i>	-

Tool	Section	ApprenticeshipQ Criteria	How it relates		Description	Recommendation
			Contribute / Complement	Conflict		
					<i>“Institution should publish information about their activities [including the programmes they offer and the selection criteria for them, the intended learning outcomes of these programmes, the qualifications they award, the teaching, learning and assessment procedures used, the pass rates and the learning opportunities available to their students] which is clear, accurate, objective, up-to date and readily accessible.”</i>	
ESG	ESG 1.1 and 1.2, but also 1.3, 1.5 and 1.6	4. Definition of Standards for Placements	In line		<i>As a general approach, the guidelines in ESG 1.1 Policy for Quality Assurance establish that “The policy [for quality assurance] translates into practice through a variety of internal quality assurance processes that allow participation across the institution...The quality assurance policy also covers any elements of an institution’s activities that are subcontracted to or carried out by other parties.” this would mean that the quality assurance policy of the institution should cover the definition of standards for placements, involving all stakeholders. ESG 1.2 Design and approval of programmes includes the option to include in the programmes “well-structured placement opportunities [Placements include traineeships, internships and other periods of the programme that are not spent in the institution but that allow the student to gain experience in an area related to their studies] where appropriate”. In addition, when defining standards for placements all the following standards should be considered as well:</i>	-

Tool	Section	ApprenticeshipQ Criteria	How it relates		Description	Recommendation
			Contribute / Complement	Conflict		
					<p>a. ESG 1.3 Student-centred learning, teaching and assessment, when talking about learning objectives and the learning process.</p> <p>b. ESG 1.5 Teaching staff and ESG 1.6 Learning resources and student support, when talking about mentoring and supervision.</p>	
ESG	ESG 1.1	5.Identification (finding) of Placement-Positions	In line		As commented before, and as a general approach, the guidelines in ESG 1.1 Policy for Quality Assurance establish that "The policy [for quality assurance] translates into practice through a variety of internal quality assurance processes that allow participation across the institution...The quality assurance policy also covers any elements of an institution's activities that are subcontracted to or carried out by other parties." this would mean that the quality assurance policy of the institution should cover the definition of standards for placements, which should include the identification (finding) of place-positions.	-
ESG	ESG 1.1, 1.3, 1.5, 1.6, 1.8	6.Capacity building for SMEs	In line		The ESG would approach capacity building more as the training of the mentors at the SMEs so we should apply ESG 1.3 Student-centred learning, teaching and assessment and ESG 1.5 Teaching staff when dealing with "Assessors are familiar with existing testing and examination methods and receive support in developing their own skills in this field" and "Higher education institutions have primary responsibility for the quality of their staff and for providing them with a supportive environment that allows them to carry out their work effectively. Such an environment ... offers	-

Tool	Section	ApprenticeshipQ Criteria	How it relates		Description	Recommendation
			Contribute / Complement	Conflict		
					<p><i>opportunities for and promotes the professional development of teaching staff; ...". All of the above considering that ESG 1.1 establishes that "The quality assurance policy also covers any elements of an institution's activities that are subcontracted to or carried out by other parties." In addition, ESG 1.6 Learning resources and student support, also establishes that "In delivering support services the role of support and administrative staff is crucial and therefore they need to be qualified and have opportunities to develop their competences."</i></p> <p><i>Nevertheless, the criterium seems to be more focused on the information and resources provided by the institution to the SMEs. In this case, what the criterium addresses would be covered by ESG 1.1 and 1.8.</i></p>	
ESG	ESG 1.1 and 1.7	7.Management of Placement-Supply-Database	In line		<p><i>In this case, ESG 1.1 regarding the procedures for managing the database and ESG 1.7 Information management would apply, including that "Reliable data is crucial for informed decision-making and for knowing what is working well and what needs attention. Effective processes to collect and analyse information about study programmes and other activities feed into the internal quality assurance system."</i></p>	-
ESG	ESG 1.7	8.Data Protection	In line		<p><i>The ESG do not explicitly include any comment regarding data protection, nevertheless as a general approach any information management is covered by ESG 1.7 Information management.</i></p>	-
ESG	ESG 1.1	9.Establishing the Agreement	In line		<p><i>There is no specific section in the ESG which applies to this criterium, although ESG 1.1 which focuses on</i></p>	-

Tool	Section	ApprenticeshipQ Criteria	How it relates		Description	Recommendation
			Contribute / Complement	Conflict		
					<i>the policy for quality assurance, establishes that the policy “supports the involvement of external stakeholders in quality assurance” and “covers any elements of an institution’s activities that are subcontracted to or carried out by other parties.”</i>	
ESG	ESG 1.1, 1.7 and 1.8	10. Matching Students to Placements	In line		<i>In this case, ESG 1.1 regarding the procedures for managing the database of students with their profiles and the list of available placements and ESG 1.7 Information management would apply. In addition, with regards to the information available for students, ESG 1.8 would also apply.</i>	<i>- As this criterium and criterium 7 are quite related, maybe there could be just one of them regarding Matching students with placements which would cover everything related with matching the right student to the right placement.</i>
		Related to 7. Management of Placement-Supply- Database				
ESG	ESG 1.7 and 1.9	11. Monitoring of SMEs Activities	In line		<i>This criterium would be covered by ESG 1.7 Information management, as there is a need to collect, analyse and use relevant information for the effective management of the SMEs activities and this information should feed into the internal quality assurance system. Moreover, it is important that students and staff are involved in providing and analysing information and planning follow-up activities. In addition, ESG 1.9 On-going monitoring and periodic review of programmes establishes that “Institutions should monitor and periodically review their programmes to ensure that they achieve the objectives set for them and respond to the needs of</i>	-

Tool	Section	ApprenticeshipQ Criteria	How it relates		Description	Recommendation
			Contribute / Complement	Conflict		
					<i>students and society. These reviews should lead to continuous improvement of the programme. Any action planned or taken as a result should be communicated to all those concerned.” which would apply as well to the activities performed at the SMEs.</i>	
ESG	ESG 1.7 and 1.9 and also 1.3 and 1.4	12. Monitoring of Student Activities	In line		This criterium is closely related with the previous one “11. Monitoring of SMEs Activities”, so ESG 1.7 and 1.9 should apply. As talking about student activities, ESG 1.3 Student-centred learning, teaching and assessment “The implementation of student-centred learning and teaching regularly evaluates and adjusts the modes of delivery and pedagogical methods” and 1.4 Admission, recognition, progression and certification “Institutions need to put in place both processes and tools to collect, monitor and act on information on student progression” would apply too.	-
		Closely related to 11. Monitoring of SMEs Activities				
ESG	ESG 1.6	13. User Support and Issue Resolution	In line		The closest standard would be ESG 1.6 Learning resources and student support while it deals different kind of facilities and support services as IT infrastructures and it establishes that student should be informed about the services available to them.	-
ESG	ESG 1.1	14. Evaluation of Apprenticeships Relates to 11. Monitoring of SMEs Activities	In line		See 11. Monitoring of SMEs Activities, in addition ESG 1.1 covers the quality assurance system and its procedures which the evaluation of apprenticeships should be addressed.	-
ESG	ESG 1.3	15. Assessment design	In line		Assessment is specifically addressed at ESG 1.3 Student-centred learning, teaching and assessment with a whole section of its guidelines focusing on it: “Considering the importance of assessment for the students’ progression and their future careers, quality	-

Tool	Section	ApprenticeshipQ Criteria	How it relates		Description	Recommendation
			Contribute / Complement	Conflict		
					<p><i>assurance processes for assessment take into account the following:</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <i>• Assessors are familiar with existing testing and examination methods and receive support in developing their own skills in this field;</i> <i>• The criteria for and method of assessment as well as criteria for marking are published in advance;</i> <i>• The assessment allows students to demonstrate the extent to which the intended learning outcomes have been achieved. Students are given feedback, which, if necessary, is linked to advice on the learning process;</i> <i>• Where possible, assessment is carried out by more than one examiner;</i> <i>• The regulations for assessment take into account mitigating circumstances;</i> <i>• Assessment is consistent, fairly applied to all students and carried out in accordance with the stated procedures;</i> <i>• A formal procedure for student appeals is in place.”</i> 	
ESG	ESG 1.3	16.Performing and Monitoring the Assessment	In line		See previous criterium.	-
ESG	-	17.Grading	In line		There is no specific mention to grading on the ESG, but it should be related with the assessment.	-
ESG	ESG 1.4	18.Certification and Recognition	In line		Recognition and certification issues are covered by ESG 1.4. Student admission, progression, recognition and certification where it is established that “Institutions should consistently apply pre-defined and published regulations covering all phases of the	-

Tool	Section	ApprenticeshipQ Criteria	How it relates		Description	Recommendation
			Contribute / Complement	Conflict		
					<p><i>student “life cycle”, e.g. student admission, progression, recognition and certification.” Furthermore, the guidelines state “Fair recognition of higher education qualifications, periods of study and prior learning, including the recognition of non-formal and informal learning, are essential components for ensuring the students’ progress in their studies, while promoting mobility. Appropriate recognition procedures rely on:</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <i>• institutional practice for recognition being in line with the principles of the Lisbon Recognition Convention;</i> <i>• cooperation with other institutions, quality assurance agencies and the national ENIC/NARIC centre with a view to ensuring coherent recognition across the country.</i> <p><i>Graduation represents the culmination of the students’ period of study. Students need to receive documentation explaining the qualification gained, including achieved learning outcomes and the context, level, content and status of the studies that were pursued and successfully completed.”</i></p>	
ESG	ESG 1.3	19.Complaints and Appeals	In line		<p><i>The ESG only include guidance regarding students’ complaints at ESG 1.3 Student-centred learning, teaching and assessment when it is established that “The implementation of student-centred learning and teaching [...] has appropriate procedures for dealing with students’ complaints.”</i></p>	-
Quality Apprentices at SMEs						

Tool	Section	ApprenticeshipQ Criteria	How it relates		Description	Recommendation
			Contribute / Complement	Conflict		
ESG	ESG 1.1	20.Preparation for the Apprenticeship	In line		<i>The ESG do not preview any specific guidance regarding activities outside the institution but what is included at ESG 1.1 “The quality assurance policy also covers any elements of an institution’s activities that are subcontracted to or carried out by other parties.”</i>	-
ESG	ESG 1.3 and 1.5	21.Identifying Mentors	In line		<i>It could be considered that the same that applies for academic staff inside the higher education institution (ESG 1.5), should apply to mentors at the SMEs including the student-centred learning approach (ESG 1.3).</i>	-
ESG	ESG 1.1	22.Establishing the Agreement	In line		See criterium 9.	-
		Relates to 9.Establishing the Agreement				
ESG	ESG 1.1, 1.7 and 1.8	23.Matching Students with Placements	In line		See criterium 10.	-
		Relates to 10.Matching Students to Placements				
ESG	ESG 1.1	24.Preparation for the apprenticeship	In line		See criterium 20.	<i>This criterium might be included in criterium 20.</i>
		Related to 20.Preparation for the Apprenticeship				

Tool	Section	ApprenticeshipQ Criteria	How it relates		Description	Recommendation
			Contribute / Complement	Conflict		
ESG	ESG 1.3	25.Integration of the apprentice	In line		ESG 1.3 could in a very general way cover this criterium as the student should be the focus of the apprenticeship following the spirit of the ESG with a student-centred approach.	-
ESG	ESG 1.3 and 1.5	26.Mentoring	In line		As in the previous criterium ESG 1.3 which includes the relationship between students and teachers (in this case mentors) and the ESG 1.5, Teaching staff, could apply in a very general way. Nevertheless, the indicators focus more on the procedures in place.	-
ESG	ESG 1.2, 1.4 and 1.7	27.Records of Apprenticeships	In line		The records would be covered at ESG 1.4 as “Institutions need to put in place both processes and tools to collect, monitor and act on information on student progression.” The study programme design (ESG 1.2) could “include well-structured placement opportunities where appropriate” although the specific plan/schedule should be defined for each placement and student and this information should feed into the internal quality assurance system as established at ESG 1.7 Information management.	-
ESG	ESG 1.1, 1.3, 1.7 and 1.9	28.Assessment of learning	In line		See criteria 15 regarding the assessment of the student, and 11 and 14 regarding the evaluation of the process.	-
		Related to:				
		11.Monitoring of SMEs Activities, 14.Evaluation of Apprenticeships, and 15.Assessment design				

Tool	Section	ApprenticeshipQ Criteria	How it relates		Description	Recommendation
			Contribute / Complement	Conflict		
ESG	ESG 1.1, 1.7 and 1.9	29.Evaluation of process	In line		See criteria 11 and 14.	-
		Related to:				
		11.Monitoring of SMEs Activities,				
		14.Evaluation of Apprenticeships				
ESG	ESG 1.1, 1.7 and 1.9	30.Quality Management Procedures	In line		See previous comments regarding ESG 1.1, 1.7, 1.9.	-

6.4 Annex IV: Analysis of the tool ISO 21001

Table 4: ISO 21001 relation with the ApprenticeshipQ Criteria

Tool	Section	ApprenticeshipQ Criteria	How it relates		Description	Recommendation
			Contribute / Complement	Conflict		
ISO 21001:2018	ALL	ALL		X	The two documents use different terminology	R#1: Harmonize AppQ terminology with ISO 21001 (and also ISO 9001) to facilitate integrated implementation both at HEIs and at SMEs.
ISO 21001:2018	8.3.2 Design and development planning	HEI #1	X		The two documents address the same subject and AppQ complements ISO 21001 as it has more prescriptive requirements in this subject.	NA
		Involvement of Stakeholders in Designing Learning Objectives				
					ISO 21001 users can use AppQ to fine tune their practices.	
ISO 21001:2018	8.3.4.3 Curriculum design and development controls	HEI #2	X		The two documents address the same subject and AppQ complements ISO 21001 as it has more prescriptive requirements in this subject.	NA
		Definition of SMART Learning Objectives				

Tool	Section	ApprenticeshipQ Criteria	How it relates		Description	Recommendation
			Contribute / Complement	Conflict		
					ISO 21001 users can use AppQ to fine tune their practices.	
ISO 21001:2018	4.2 Understanding the needs and expectations of interested parties	HEI #3	X		The two documents address the same subject with the same approach.	NA
		Transparency				
	8.3.5 Design and development outputs					
ISO 21001:2018	8.2.2 Communicating the requirements for the educational products and services	HEI #4	X		The two documents address the same subject and AppQ complements ISO 21001 as it has more prescriptive requirements in this subject – and specifically addressing apprenticeships.	NA
		Definition of Standards for Placements				
					ISO 21001 users can use AppQ to fine tune their practices.	
ISO 21001:2018	8.4 Control of externally provided processes,	HEI #5	X		The two documents address the same subject, but in very different ways. AppQ complements ISO 21001 as it has more prescriptive requirements in this subject –	NA

Tool	Section	ApprenticeshipQ Criteria	How it relates		Description	Recommendation
			Contribute / Complement	Conflict		
	<i>products and services</i>				<i>and specifically addressing apprenticeships.</i>	
		<i>Identification (finding) of Placement- Positions</i>				
					<i>ISO 21001 users can use AppQ to fine tune their practices.</i>	
<i>ISO 21001:2018</i>	<i>7.2 Competence</i>	<i>HEI #6</i>	<i>X</i>		<i>The two documents address the same subject, but in very different ways. AppQ complements ISO 21001 as it has more prescriptive requirements in this subject – and specifically addressing apprenticeships.</i>	<i>NA</i>
		<i>Capacity building for placement providers</i>				
					<i>ISO 21001 users can use AppQ to fine tune their practices.</i>	
<i>ISO 21001:2018</i>	<i>7.5 Documented information</i>	<i>HEI #7 Management of Placement-Supply- Database</i>	<i>X</i>		<i>The two documents address the same subject, but in very different ways. AppQ complements ISO 21001 as it has more prescriptive requirements in this subject – and specifically addressing apprenticeships.</i>	<i>NA</i>

Tool	Section	ApprenticeshipQ Criteria	How it relates		Description	Recommendation
			Contribute / Complement	Conflict		
					ISO 21001 users can use AppQ to fine tune their practices.	
ISO 21001:2018	8.5.5 Protection and transparency of learners' data	HEI #8	X		The two documents address the same subject, but in very different ways. ISO 21001 has much more prescriptive requirements in this subject.	Develop the requirement further at AppQ, based on ISO 21001 example.
		Data Protection				
					AppQ users can use ISO 21001 to fine tune their practices	
ISO 21001:2018	8.2.2 Communicating the requirements for the educational products and services	HEI #9	X		The two documents address the same subject, but in very different ways. AppQ complements ISO 21001 as it has more prescriptive requirements in this subject – and specifically addressing apprenticeships.	NA
		Establishing the Agreement				
					ISO 21001 users can use AppQ to fine tune their practices.	
ISO 21001:2018	8.2.2 Communicating the requirements for the educational products and services	HEI #10 Matching apprentices to Placements	X		The two documents address the same subject, but in very different ways. AppQ complements ISO 21001 as it has more prescriptive requirements in this subject – and specifically addressing apprenticeships.	NA

Tool	Section	ApprenticeshipQ Criteria	How it relates		Description	Recommendation
			Contribute / Complement	Conflict		
	8.4 Control of externally provided processes, products and services				ISO 21001 users can use AppQ to fine tune their practices.	
ISO 21001:2018	9.2 Internal audit	HEI #11	X		The two documents address the same subject, but in very different ways. AppQ complements ISO 21001 as it has more prescriptive requirements in this subject – and specifically addressing apprenticeships.	NA
		Monitoring of placement providers Activities				
					ISO 21001 users can use AppQ to fine tune their practices.	
ISO 21001:2018	7.4 Communicat ion	HEI #12	X		The two documents address the same subject, but in very different ways. AppQ complements ISO 21001 as it has more prescriptive requirements in this subject – and specifically addressing apprenticeships.	NA
		Monitoring of apprentice Activities				
					ISO 21001 users can use AppQ to fine tune their practices.	

Tool	Section	ApprenticeshipQ Criteria	How it relates		Description	Recommendation
			Contribute / Complement	Conflict		
ISO 21001:2018	9.1.2.2 Handling of complaints and appeals	HEI #13	X		The two documents address the same subject, but in very different ways. AppQ complements ISO 21001 as it has more prescriptive requirements in this subject – and specifically addressing apprenticeships.	NA
		User Support and Issue Resolution				
					ISO 21001 users can use AppQ to fine tune their practices.	
ISO 21001:2018	9.1.2 Satisfaction of learners, other beneficiaries and staff	HEI #14	X		The two documents address the same subject, but in very different ways. AppQ complements ISO 21001 as it has more prescriptive requirements in this subject – and specifically addressing apprenticeships.	NA
		Evaluation of Apprenticeships				
					ISO 21001 users can use AppQ to fine tune their practices.	
ISO 21001:2018	8.3.4.4 Summative assessment design and development controls	HEI #15	X		The two documents address the same subject, but in very different ways. AppQ complements ISO 21001 as it has more prescriptive requirements in this subject – and specifically addressing apprenticeships.	NA
		Assessment design				
					ISO 21001 users can use AppQ to fine tune their practices. NA	

Tool	Section	ApprenticeshipQ Criteria	How it relates		Description	Recommendation
			Contribute / Complement	Conflict		
ISO 21001:2018	8.5.1.4 Summative assessment	HEI #16	X		<i>The two documents address the same subject, but in very different ways. ISO 21001 has much more prescriptive requirements in this subject.</i>	<i>Develop the requirements further at AppQ, based on ISO 21001 example.</i>
		<i>Performing and Monitoring the Assessment</i>				
	8.5.2 Identification and traceability				<i>AppQ users can use ISO 21001 to fine tune their practices</i>	
	8.5.5 Protection and transparency of learners' data					
ISO 21001:2018	8.5.1.4 Summative assessment	HEI #17	X		<i>The two documents address the same subject and AppQ complements ISO 21001 as it has more prescriptive requirements in this subject.</i>	NA
		<i>Grading</i>				
					<i>ISO 21001 users can use AppQ to fine tune their practices.</i>	

Tool	Section	ApprenticeshipQ Criteria	How it relates		Description	Recommendation
			Contribute / Complement	Conflict		
ISO 21001:2018	8.5.1.5 Recognition of assessed learning	HEI #18	X		<i>The two documents address the same subject and they complement each other as both have more prescriptive requirements than the other in different aspects.</i>	<i>Develop the requirement further at AppQ, based on ISO 21001 example.</i>
		Certification and Recognition				
					<i>ISO 21001 users can use AppQ to fine tune their practices and AppQ users can also use ISO 21001 to fine tune their practices.</i>	
ISO 21001:2018	9.1.2.2 Handling of complaints and appeals	HEI #19	X		<i>The two documents address the same subject and ISO 21001 complements AppQ as it has more prescriptive requirements in this subject</i>	
		Complaints and Appeals				
					<i>AppQ users can use ISO 21001 to fine tune their practices</i>	
ISO 21001:2018	5.3 Organization al roles, responsibilities and authorities	SME #1 (20)	X		<i>The two documents address the same subject and they complement each other as both have more prescriptive requirements than the other in different aspects.</i>	
	6.1 Actions to address risks and	Preparation for the Apprenticeship				

Tool	Section	ApprenticeshipQ Criteria	How it relates		Description	Recommendation
			Contribute / Complement	Conflict		
	opportunities					
					ISO 21001 users can use AppQ to fine tune their practices and AppQ users can also use ISO 21001 to fine tune their practices.	
	7.1.2 Human resources					
	7.1.3 Facilities					
ISO 21001:2018	5.3 Organizational roles, responsibilities and authorities	SME #2 (21)	X		The two documents address the same subject, but in very different ways. AppQ complements ISO 21001 as it has more prescriptive requirements in this subject – and specifically addressing apprenticeships.	NA
		Identifying Mentors				
	7.2 Competence				ISO 21001 users can use AppQ to fine tune their practices. NA	
	7.4 Communication					
ISO 21001:2018	8.2.2 Communicating the requirement	SME #3 (22)	X		The two documents address the same subject, but in very different ways. AppQ complements ISO 21001 as it has more prescriptive requirements in this subject –	NA

Tool	Section	ApprenticeshipQ Criteria	How it relates		Description	Recommendation
			Contribute / Complement	Conflict		
	s for the educational products and services				and specifically addressing apprenticeships.	
		Establishing the Agreement				
	8.5.1.2 Admission of learners				ISO 21001 users can use AppQ to fine tune their practices. NA	
ISO 21001:2018	8.5.1.2 Admission of learners	SME #4 (23)	X		The two documents address the same subject, but in very different ways. AppQ complements ISO 21001 as it has more prescriptive requirements in this subject – and specifically addressing apprenticeships.	NA
		Matching apprentices with Placements				
					ISO 21001 users can use AppQ to fine tune their practices.	
ISO 21001:2018	8.2.2 Communicat ing the requirement s for the educational products and services	SME #5 (24)	X		The two documents address the same subject, but in very different ways. AppQ complements ISO 21001 as it has more prescriptive requirements in this subject – and specifically addressing apprenticeships.	NA
		Conditions of the apprenticeship				

Tool	Section	ApprenticeshipQ Criteria	How it relates		Description	Recommendation
			Contribute / Complement	Conflict		
	8.5.1.2 Admission of learners				ISO 21001 users can use AppQ to fine tune their practices.	
ISO 21001:2018	8.2.2 Communicat ing the requirement s for the educational products and services	SME #6 (25)	X		The two documents address the same subject, but in very different ways. AppQ complements ISO 21001 as it has more prescriptive requirements in this subject – and specifically addressing apprenticeships.	NA
		Integration of the apprentice				
	8.5.1.2 Admission of learners				ISO 21001 users can use AppQ to fine tune their practices.	
ISO 21001:2018	8.5.1 Control of delivery of the educational products and services	SME #7 (26)	X		The two documents address the same subject, but in very different ways. AppQ complements ISO 21001 as it has more prescriptive requirements in this subject – and specifically addressing apprenticeships.	NA
		Mentoring				
					ISO 21001 users can use AppQ to fine tune their practices.	
ISO 21001:2018	4.04.2002	SME #8 (27)	X		Although ISO 21001 addresses the need for the organization “retain documented information to have confidence that the processes are being carried out as	NA

Tool	Section	ApprenticeshipQ Criteria	How it relates		Description	Recommendation
			Contribute / Complement	Conflict		
		<i>Records of apprenticeships</i>			<i>planed” in a general way, AppQ has more concrete and prescriptive requirements in this subject – and specifically addressing apprenticeships.</i>	
	<i>8.1 Operational planning and control</i>					
	<i>8.1.1 General bullet e)</i>				<i>ISO 21001 users can use AppQ to fine tune their practices.</i>	
<i>ISO 21001:2018</i>	<i>8.5.1.4 Summative assessment</i>	<i>SME #9 (28)</i>	<i>X</i>		<i>The two documents address the same subject, but in very different ways. AppQ complements ISO 21001 as it has more prescriptive requirements in this subject – and specifically addressing apprenticeships.</i>	<i>NA</i>
		<i>Assessment of learning</i>				
					<i>ISO 21001 users can use AppQ to fine tune their practices.</i>	
<i>ISO 21001:2018</i>	<i>8.1 Operational planning and control</i>	<i>SME #10 (29)</i>	<i>X</i>		<i>The two documents address the same subject, but in very different ways. AppQ complements ISO 21001 as it has more prescriptive requirements in this subject – and specifically addressing apprenticeships.</i>	<i>NA</i>
		<i>Evaluation of process</i>				

Tool	Section	ApprenticeshipQ Criteria	How it relates		Description	Recommendation
			Contribute / Complement	Conflict		
	9.1 <i>Monitoring, measureme nt, analysis and evaluation</i>				<i>ISO 21001 users can use AppQ to fine tune their practices.</i>	
ISO 21001:2018	4.4 <i>Managemen t system for educational organization s (EOMS)</i>	SME #11 (30)	X		<i>The two documents address the same subject, but in very different ways. AppQ complements ISO 21001 as it has more prescriptive requirements in this subject – and specifically addressing apprenticeships.</i>	NA
		Quality Management Procedures				
					<i>ISO 21001 users can use AppQ to fine tune their practices.</i>	

6.5 Annex V: Analysis of the tool EQAVET

Table 5: EQAVET relation with the ApprenticeshipQ Criteria

Tool	Section	ApprenticeshipQ Criteria	How it relates		Description	Recommendation
			Contribute / Complement	Conflict		
EQAVET	C1P2. Participation of internal and external stakeholders in defining the institution's strategic objectives.	1. Involvement of Stakeholders in Designing Learning Objectives	X		One of the key factors in quality assurance in Vocational Education and Training (VET) assumed by EQAVET is the involvement of internal and external stakeholders.	
	C2I1. Diversity of partnerships with VET operators, and other external stakeholders depending on their nature (regular activities, emerging critical issues, strategic options in VET management).					
	C3A4. Participation of internal and external stakeholders in the contextualized analysis of the results and in the consensus of improvements to be made in institution management.					
	C5T1. Participation of internal and external stakeholders in a continuous dialogue on the quality of the VET offer and its continuous improvement.					
EQAVET	C1P1. Alignment of the institution's strategic objectives with the policies defined for VET and available prospective studies.	2. Definition of SMART Learning Objectives	X		One of the fundamental components of the EQAVET Framework is the PDCA cycle of quality	

Tool	Section	ApprenticeshipQ Criteria	How it relates		Description	Recommendation
			Contribute / Complement	Conflict		
	C1P3. Explanation of the components involved in the planning of the VET offer and respective timetable.				management, based on the Deming cycle. However, without the definition of SMART objectives in the planning phase, the entire cycle fails, what makes EQUAVET implementation impossible.	
	C1P4. Alignment of planned activities with the institution's strategic objectives.					
	C6T2. Application of the guarantee and quality improvement cycle in the global and intermediate management of the VET offer, depending on the intermediate objectives monitoring and the specific duration of the involved activities.					
EQUAVET	C4R3. Availability of the results of the evaluation and the results of the review on the institutional website.	3. Transparency	X			
	C5T1. Participation of internal and external stakeholders in a continuous dialogue on the quality of the VET offer and its continuous improvement.					
	C5T2. The availability of information on the continuous improvement of the VET offer, on the internal network and on the institution's website.					

Tool	Section	ApprenticeshipQ Criteria	How it relates		Description	Recommendation
			Contribute / Complement	Conflict		
EQAVET	C1P1. Alignment of the institution's strategic objectives with the policies defined for VET and available prospective studies.	4. Definition of Standards for Placements	X		The compliance of the criteria 4 can help the organizations in aligning their objectives with the policies defined for VET, namely by contributing to the fulfilment of legal requirements (the implementation of the apprenticeship - WBL of courses is defined and regulated in the current legislation)	
EQAVET	C1P1. Alignment of the institution's strategic objectives with the policies defined for VET and available prospective studies.	5. Identification (finding) of Placement-Positions	X		The compliance of the criteria 5 can help the organizations to align their objectives with the policies defined for VET, namely by contributing to the fulfilment of legal requirements (the implementation of the apprenticeship - WBL of courses is defined and	
	C2I1. Diversity of partnerships with VET operators, and other external stakeholders, depending on their nature (regular activities, emerging critical issues, VET strategic options).					

Tool	Section	ApprenticeshipQ Criteria	How it relates		Description	Recommendation
			Contribute / Complement	Conflict		
	C2I2. Participation of students / trainees in projects of different scope (local, national, transnational) that favour their learning and autonomy.				regulated in the current legislation).	
EQAVET	C2I1. Diversity of partnerships with VET operators, and other external stakeholders depending on their nature (regular activities, emerging critical issues, strategic options in VET management).	6. Capacity building for SMEs	X			
	C5T1. Participation of internal and external stakeholders in a continuous dialogue on the quality of the VET offer and its continuous improvement.					
	C5T2. The availability of information on the continuous improvement of the VET offer, on the internal network and on the institution's website.					
EQAVET	C3A1. Use of EQAVET descriptors / management practices, from the selected EQAVET indicators, and others that enable intercalary monitoring, in the evaluation of VET activities and results.	7. Management of Placement-Supply-Database	X		Of the 10 indicators that make up EQAVET, the national agency (ANQEP) gave priority to the following:	

Tool	Section	ApprenticeshipQ Criteria	How it relates		Description	Recommendation
			Contribute / Complement	Conflict		
	C6T2. <i>Application of the guarantee and quality improvement cycle in the global and intermediate management of the VET offer, depending on the interim monitoring of the objectives and the specific duration of the activities involved.</i>				- VET completion rate (EQAVET indicator No. 4)	
					a) Percentage of students / trainees completing initial VET courses (i.e. obtaining a qualification) in relation to the total number of students / trainees entering these courses.	
	<i>Indicators EQAVET</i>				- Placement fee after completion of VET courses (indicator No. 5 of EQAVET)	
					a) Proportion of students / trainees who complete a VET course and who are in the labour market, in training (including higher education) or other destinations, within 12-36 months after completing the course.	
					- Use of skills acquired in the workplace (EQAVET indicator No.6)	

Tool	Section	ApprenticeshipQ Criteria	How it relates		Description	Recommendation
			Contribute / Complement	Conflict		
					a) <i>Percentage of students / trainees completing a VET course and working in professions directly related to the Education / Training course / area they completed.</i>	
					b) <i>Percentage of employers who are satisfied with the trainees who have completed a VET course.</i>	
					The monitoring of these indicators requires the existence of a constantly updated database, containing the data of both students / alumni and companies / organizations.	
EQAVET	C1P1. <i>Alignment of the institution's strategic objectives with the policies defined for VET and available prospective studies.</i>	8. <i>Data Protection</i>	X		Compliance with legal requirements.	

Tool	Section	ApprenticeshipQ Criteria	How it relates		Description	Recommendation
			Contribute / Complement	Conflict		
EQAVET	C1P1. Alignment of the institution's strategic objectives with the policies defined for VET and available prospective studies.	9. Establishing the Agreement	X		The compliance of criteria 9 can help the organizations to align their objectives with the policies defined for VET, namely by contributing to the fulfilment of legal requirements (the implementation of the apprenticeship - WBL of courses is defined and regulated in the current legislation).	
EQAVET	C1P4. Alignment of planned activities with the institution's strategic objectives.	10. Matching Students to Placements	X			
EQAVET	C1P3. Explanation of the components involved in the planning of the VET offer and respective timetable.	11. Monitoring of SMEs Activities	X		Monitoring of all processes is an integral and fundamental part of EQAVET.	
	C3A1. Use of EQAVET descriptors / management practices, from the selected EQAVET indicators, and others that enable intercalary monitoring, in the evaluation of VET activities and results.					

Tool	Section	ApprenticeshipQ Criteria	How it relates		Description	Recommendation
			Contribute / Complement	Conflict		
	C3A2. Mid-term monitoring of established objectives and goals and timely identification of improvements to be made to the management of VET. C3A3. Use of early warning mechanisms to anticipate deviations from the objectives set.					
EQAVET	C1P3. Explanation of the components involved in the planning of the VET offer and respective timetable. C3A1. Use of EQAVET descriptors / management practices, from the selected EQAVET indicators, and others that enable intercalary monitoring, in the evaluation of VET activities and results. C3A2. Mid-term monitoring of established objectives and goals and timely identification of improvements to be made to the management of VET. C3A3. Use of early warning mechanisms to anticipate deviations from the objectives set.	12. Monitoring of Student Activities	X		Monitoring of all processes is an integral and fundamental part of EQAVET.	
EQAVET	C5T1. Participation of internal and external stakeholders in a continuous dialogue on the quality	13. User Support and Issue Resolution	X		The existence of a helpdesk can, in addition to being a privileged point	

Tool	Section	ApprenticeshipQ Criteria	How it relates		Description	Recommendation
			Contribute / Complement	Conflict		
	<p><i>of the VET offer and its continuous improvement.</i></p> <p>C3A3. Use of early warning mechanisms to anticipate deviations from the objectives set.</p>				of connection between stakeholders, serve as another mechanism for early warning of deviations.	
EQAVET	C1P1. Alignment of the institution's strategic objectives with the policies defined for VET and available prospective studies.	14. Evaluation of Apprenticeships	X		In addition to be a legal requirement, the evaluation of all processes is an integral part of EQAVET.	
	C3A1. Use of EQAVET descriptors / management practices, from the selected EQAVET indicators, and others that enable intercalary monitoring, in the evaluation of VET activities and results.					
	C3A2. Mid-term monitoring of established objectives and goals and timely identification of improvements to be made to the management of VET.					
	C3A4. Participation of internal and external stakeholders in the contextualized analysis of the results obtained and in the consensus of improvements to be made in the VET management.					
	C4R1. Review of what was planned, through the adoption of improvements of different nature, based on the results of the VET assessment and the feedback					

Tool	Section	ApprenticeshipQ Criteria	How it relates		Description	Recommendation
			Contribute / Complement	Conflict		
	<i>obtained on the satisfaction of internal and external stakeholders.</i>					
EQAVET	C1P1. Alignment of the institution's strategic objectives with the policies defined for VET and available prospective studies.	15. Assessment design	X			
EQAVET	C1P1. Alignment of the institution's strategic objectives with the policies defined for VET and available prospective studies. C3A4. Participation of internal and external stakeholders in the contextualized analysis of the results and in the consensus of improvements to be made in the quality management.	16. Performing and Monitoring the Assessment				
EQAVET	C1P1. Alignment of the institution's strategic objectives with the policies defined for VET and available prospective studies.	17. Grading	X			
EQAVET	C1P1. Alignment of the institution's strategic objectives with the policies defined for VET and available prospective studies.	18. Certification and Recognition	X			
EQAVET	C3A3. Use of early warning mechanisms to anticipate deviations from the objectives set.	19. Complaints and Appeals	X			
EQAVET	C1P1. Alignment of the institution's strategic objectives with the policies defined for VET and available prospective studies.	20. Preparation for the Apprenticeship	X		Considering that the ApprenticeshipQ criteria 20 to 30 are specific to employers, particularly	

Tool	Section	ApprenticeshipQ Criteria	How it relates		Description	Recommendation
			Contribute / Complement	Conflict		
					SMEs, it will, in my view, be more difficult to find a direct relationship with the tool under analysis, namely EQAVET.	
EQAVET	C2I1. Diversity of partnerships with VET operators, and other external stakeholders depending on their nature (regular activities, emerging critical issues, strategic options in VET management).	21. Identifying Mentors	X		Nevertheless, assuming a more open / comprehensive perspective, I believe it is not unreasonable to assume that the fulfilment of these criteria by the host institutions for trainees can contribute to the fulfilment of EQAVET criteria C1P1, C2I1 and C5T1, namely, because:	
EQAVET	C5T1. Participation of internal and external stakeholders in a continuous dialogue on the quality of the VET offer and its continuous improvement.	22. Establishing the Agreement	X		· can assist education and vocational training entities in aligning their objectives with the policies defined for VET specifically through compliance with legal requirements;	
EQAVET		23. Matching Students with Placements	X		· as already mentioned, constant and systematic dialogue with stakeholders is one of the main pillars of EQAVET. Trainees / employers host entities are, alongside	

Tool	Section	ApprenticeshipQ Criteria	How it relates		Description	Recommendation
			Contribute / Complement	Conflict		
					students, guardians and employees, central stakeholders throughout the teaching-learning process.	
EQAVET		24. Preparation for the apprenticeship	X			
EQAVET		25. Integration of the apprentice	X			
EQAVET		26. Mentoring	X			
EQAVET		27. Records of Apprenticeships	X			
EQAVET		28. Assessment of learning	X			
EQAVET		29. Evaluation of process	X			
EQAVET		30. Quality Management Procedures	X			
EQAVET	Attachment 1 (P2; P6; P8; P10)	1. Involvement of Stakeholders in Designing Learning Objectives	X		(Apprenticeship methodology "dating to marriage" (1 student, 1 PME, 3 years)	
					Listening of all stakeholders	
EQAVET	Attachment 2 e R1	2. Definition of SMART Learning Objectives	X			
EQAVET	Attachment 1 R1	3. Transparency	X			

Tool	Section	ApprenticeshipQ Criteria	How it relates		Description	Recommendation
			Contribute / Complement	Conflict		
EQAVET	C1	4. Definition of Standards for Placements	X		All documents are defined through the VET strategic objectives	
EQAVET	Attachment 1 (P5; I4; I6) and base document	5. Identification (finding) of Placement-Positions	X			
EQAVET	_____	6. Capacity building for SMEs			There is no comparation in this point	
EQAVET	_____	7. Management of Placement-Supply-Database	X		There is no point in EQAVET that addresses this issue. However, there is its own program with defined access for each user.	
EQAVET	_____	8. Data Protection			In the EQAVET process, there is no point where data protection is addressed, it is implicit in the entire process	
EQAVET	Planning phase	9. Establishing the Agreement	x		Only protocol between entities	
EQAVET	Planning phase	10. Matching Students to Placements	X		Students are allocated to companies through their profile	
EQAVET	Planning phase	11. Monitoring of SMEs Activities	X		Students are regularly monitored	
EQAVET	Planning phase	12. Monitoring of Student Activities	X		Students are regularly monitored	

Tool	Section	ApprenticeshipQ Criteria	How it relates		Description	Recommendation
			Contribute / Complement	Conflict		
EQAVET	Planning phase	13. User Support and Issue Resolution	X		All the institution's support contacts are defined and disseminated	
EQAVET	Planning phase	14. Evaluation of Apprenticeships	X		Students are assessed during their course	
EQAVET	Planning phase	15. Assessment design	X		There are pre-defined templates for reporting and filling in the necessary information	
EQAVET	Planning phase	16. Performing and Monitoring the Assessment	X		At the beginning of the apprenticeship period, a work plan and respective schedules are defined	
EQAVET	Evaluation phase	17. Grading	X		There are already outlined procedures for registering classifications	
EQAVET		18. Certification and Recognition	X		There are already outlined procedures for the recognition and certification	
EQAVET		19. Complaints and Appeals			There is no point in the EQAVET process that addresses this issue directly. It is implicit in the quality process	
EQAVET	Planning phase	20. Preparation for the Apprenticeship				
EQAVET	Planning phase	21. Identifying Mentors				
EQAVET	Planning phase	22. Establishing the Agreement				

Tool	Section	ApprenticeshipQ Criteria	How it relates		Description	Recommendation
			Contribute / Complement	Conflict		
EQAVET	Planning phase	23. Matching Students with Placements				
EQAVET	Planning phase	24. Preparation for the apprenticeship				
EQAVET	Planning phase	25. Integration of the apprentice				
EQAVET	Evaluation phase	26. Mentoring				
EQAVET	Evaluation phase - R2	27. Records of Apprenticeships				
EQAVET	Evaluation phase	28. Assessment of learning				
EQAVET	Evaluation phase	29. Evaluation of process				
EQAVET	Every phases of EQAVET	30. Quality Management Procedures	X		All phases to be implemented by EQAVET, are governed by the Quality management procedures defined and implemented	

6.6 Annex VI: Analysis of the tool ECTS

Table 6: ECTS relation with the ApprenticeshipQ Criteria

Tool	Section	ApprenticeshipQ Criteria	How it relates		Description	Recommendation
			Contribute / Complement	Conflict		
ECTS	All	All	X		<i>The use of equivalence mechanisms such as ECTS helps to facilitate the recognition and development of international cooperative training activities.</i>	<i>The use of equivalence mechanisms such as ECTS helps to facilitate the recognition and development of international cooperative training activities and therefore should be used in different criteria.</i>
ECTS	All	18. Certification and Recognition	X		<i>The certification and recognition criterion is one of the most affected by this mechanism.</i>	
					<i>The manual establishes as MI that the institution must have a documented procedure to award credits and the method for allocation of transferable credit.</i>	
ECTS	All	18. Certification and Recognition	X		<i>In our experience, the recognized credits and the corresponding time periods are not homogeneous among</i>	<i>The procedures must include the learning period developed and the corresponding credit recognition mechanism such as ECTS.</i>

Tool	Section	ApprenticeshipQ Criteria	How it relates		Description	Recommendation
			Contribute / Complement	Conflict		
					<i>the HVETs of the different countries in Dual international activities.</i>	
ECTS	All	All	X		<i>The credit granting mechanisms are not explicit in the different procedures, the time measure being drafted in a generic way.</i>	
ECTS	All	2. Definition of SMART Learning Objectives	X		<i>Learning outcomes must be specified as a function of time developed but the equivalence mechanism is not defined.</i>	<i>The criterion must include the learning period developed and the corresponding credit recognition mechanism such as ECTS.</i>
ECTS	All	12. Monitoring of Student Activities	X		<i>The monitoring of tasks and time must be consistent with the learning agreement (SMART Learning objectives).</i>	<i>The criterion must include the learning period developed and the corresponding credit recognition mechanism such as ECTS.</i>
					<i>In our case, the academic tutor verifies that the homework times are in accordance with the plan and the learning agreement ECTS recognition (mobility).</i>	
					<i>In the event of a problem, action must be taken as soon as possible.</i>	

Tool	Section	ApprenticeshipQ Criteria	How it relates		Description	Recommendation
			Contribute / Complement	Conflict		
<i>ECTS</i>	<i>All</i>	<i>18. Certification and Recognition</i>	<i>X</i>		<i>A certification could be defined that is based on the ECTS of the curriculum developed internationally which could be recognized as an international dual activity.</i>	<i>Include as a measure indicator a method for allocating transferable credits in international cooperative training.</i>
<i>ECTS</i>	<i>All</i>		<i>X</i>		<i>This type of practices improves understanding among all stakeholders in an increasingly international framework. Furthermore, this type of actions will generate more and better opportunities for European university students.</i>	

6.7 Annex VI: Analysis of the tool Diploma Supplement

Table 7: Diploma Supplement relation with the ApprenticeshipQ Criteria

Tool	Section	ApprenticeshipQ Criteria	How it relates		Description	Recommendation (8)
			Contribute / Complement	Conflict		
Diploma Supplement	All	All	Complement		<i>Cloud wished to check the way in which the QC would be finalised. The intent to create a formal tool that could be developed into ISO was explained.</i>	There might be scope to refer to ECVET in some sections; e.g. section (18) on 'Certification and Recognition', which says 'Learning outcomes need to be certified to be able to be transferable and recognisable'), mentions briefly Europass but there's no reference to ECVET as a tool to record and certify credit for transfer
					<i>She anticipated no conflict with The Diploma Supplement as the manuals are aimed at the organisational level for both HVET and SME and not towards the individual (which is the purpose of The Diploma Supplement). She felt the manuals were mutually supportive and supplementary.</i>	
Diploma Supplement	All	All	Complement		<i>There is no conflict of intent between the Apprenticeship Q materials and the Diploma supplement.</i>	No recommendations are suggested

Tool	Section	ApprenticeshipQ Criteria	How it relates		Description	Recommendation (8)
			Contribute / Complement	Conflict		
					<i>The Diploma Supplement is a document which accompanies a European higher education diploma/degree. Its sections offer a description of the nature, level, context, content and status of the studies completed by its holder. The Diploma Supplement relates to HE only and is issued by different HE institutions only.</i>	
<i>Diploma Supplement</i>	<i>All</i>	<i>All</i>	<i>Complement</i>		<i>They serve a dissimilar purpose at different levels of post-school education</i>	No recommendations are suggested

6.8 Annex VII: Analysis of the tool EFQEA

Table 8: EFQEA relation with the ApprenticeshipQ Criteria

Tool	Section	ApprenticeshipQ Criteria	How it relates		Description	Recommendation
			Contribute / Complement	Conflict		
European Framework for Quality and Effective Apprenticeships	1. Written contract/agreement	9. Establishing the Agreement		X	AppQ lacks holiday entitlement. AppQ covers all other features of EFQEA and contains many additional features.	Add Measurement indicator “holiday entitlement” to AppQ QC 9.
		22. Establishing the Agreement	X			
	2. Learning outcomes	All		X	Different terminology – learning outcome (EFQEA) / learning objective (AppQ)	Harmonize terminology.
	2. Learning outcomes	1. Involvement of Stakeholders in Designing Learning Objectives		X	In higher education curricula are not developed based on existing qualification standards and/or occupational profiles.	No recommendation as the conflict is based on difference between HE and VET.
	3. Pedagogical support	11. Monitoring of SMEs Activities	X		Overlaps (trainers cooperate with institution).	
	3. Pedagogical support	21. Identifying Mentors	X		Overlaps (training for mentors).	
	3. Pedagogical support	21. Identifying Mentors	X		Overlaps (assigning qualified staff member).	
	3. Pedagogical support	20. Preparation for the Apprenticeship	X		Overlaps (SME provides guidance).	
	3. Pedagogical support	4. Definition of Standards for Placements		X	Trainings for supervisors in institution.	Add measurement indicator “access and support to

Tool	Section	ApprenticeshipQ Criteria	How it relates		Description	Recommendation
			Contribute / Complement	Conflict		
						continuing training for supervisors in HVET institution".
	4. Workplace component	In manual		X	Definition of apprenticeship is probably different. EFQEA states that part of the apprenticeship should be carried out in the workplace whereas AppQ defines it as fully carried out in the workplace (for the same reason there is no school-based training encompassed).	/
	5. Pay and/or compensation	9. Establishing the Agreement	X		Overlaps (paid or otherwise compensated).	
	6. Social protection	9. Establishing the Agreement	X		Overlaps (social protection, including necessary insurance).	
		20. Preparation for the Apprenticeship				
	7. Work, health and safety conditions	9. Establishing the Agreement	X		Overlaps (health and safety legislation).	
		20. Preparation for the Apprenticeship				
	8. Regulatory framework	1. Involvement of Stakeholders in Designing Learning Objectives	X		Overlaps (institutional and regulatory framework).	
		4. Definition of Standards for Placements				
		20. Preparation for the Apprenticeship				

Tool	Section	ApprenticeshipQ Criteria	How it relates		Description	Recommendation
			Contribute / Complement	Conflict		
	8. Regulatory framework	30. Quality Management Procedures	X		Overlaps (quality assurance measures).	
	8. Regulatory framework	1. Involvement of Stakeholders in Designing Learning Objectives		X	Different levels (e.g. national and regional levels) involved functions clearly defined and adequately allocated.	Add to QC 1.
	9. Involvement of social partners	1. Involvement of Stakeholders in Designing Learning Objectives	X		Overlaps (social partners and design).	
	10. Support for companies (cost-sharing arrangements)	6. Capacity building for SMEs		X	"Financial and/or non-financial support should be envisaged, particularly for micro-, small and medium-sized companies, enabling cost-effective apprenticeships for companies, taking into account, when appropriate, cost-sharing arrangements between employers and public authorities."	Add cost-sharing agreements.
	10. Support for companies (cost-sharing arrangements)	6. Capacity building for SMEs		X	Is there recognition, or even award, for companies that provide quality apprenticeships?	Add recognition and award, for companies that provide quality apprenticeships.

	11. Flexible pathways and mobility	Indirectly in QC 1. Involvement of Stakeholders in Designing Learning Objectives		X	<p>Chapter on Flexible pathways in EFQEA is broader than in AppQ. (e.g. mechanisms for the validation of prior learning – formal, non-formal, and informal; apprenticeship schemes provide qualifications which are formally recognised within NQF; apprenticeships offer both horizontal and vertical pathways to career development; opportunities for the mobility of apprentices at national and European levels). E.g. Entry requirements for apprenticeships should take into account relevant informal and non-formal learning and/or, if relevant, the accomplishment of preparatory programs.</p>	No recommendation. Definition of apprenticeship is probably different. Legislation sets entry conditions – indirectly included in national legislation.
--	------------------------------------	--	--	---	--	---

Tool	Section	ApprenticeshipQ Criteria	How it relates		Description	Recommendation
			Contribute / Complement	Conflict		
	12. Career guidance and awareness raising	Partially 5. Identification (finding) of Placement-Positions		X	EFQEA is broader, covering national policy of career guidance. AppQ covers institutional and operational level.	No recommendation.
	13. Transparency	3. Transparency	X		Overlaps (transparency, publication of offers). Again, EFQEA covers broader, European level whereas AppQ covers institutional level.	
		7. Management of Placement-Supply-Database				
	14. Quality assurance and graduate tracking	30. Quality Management Procedures	X		Overlaps (EFQEA in line with EQAVET, AppQ more in line with ESG).	
	14. Quality assurance and graduate tracking	15. Assessment design	X		Overlaps (assessment of the learning outcomes).	
	14. Quality assurance and graduate tracking	14. Evaluation of Apprenticeships		X	Tracking of employment and career progression.	Add graduate tracking.
	14. Quality assurance and graduate tracking	4. Definition of Standards for Placements		X	Companies are subject to quality assurance inspections carried out by independent bodies.	Add quality assurance inspections by independent bodies.

About the ApprenticeshipQ Project and this publication

The lack of work experience and the skills mismatch between labour demand and supply are two of the greatest challenges for young people to transition from the world of education to the world of work and a promising way to face those challenges are apprenticeships. To support them, the ApprenticeshipQ Project aims to develop management tools that will help higher education institutions and employers to offer and direct high-quality apprenticeships and that can serve as a basis for the development of formal international standards and guidelines.

This publication explains how the quality criteria and manuals can contribute to various European and International Recognition Tools and Instruments. A special section of the guide includes recommendations to decision and policy-makers on how to mainstream adoption of the quality criteria and manuals.



Co-funded by the
Erasmus+ Programme
of the European Union